

Contents lists available at: <u>https://e-journal.unair.ac.id</u> **AJIM (Airlangga Journal of Innovation Management)** Journal homepage: <u>https://e-journal.unair.ac.id/AJIM</u>

# Mapping Shariah Supervisory Board Literature for Islamic Finance Development

## Yusril<sup>1\*,</sup> Ega Rusanti<sup>2,</sup> Siti Zulaikha<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1,2,3</sup>Department of Islamic Economics, Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Airlangga, Indonesia

### **ARTICLE INFO**

Paper Type: Research Paper

### **Keywords:**

Sharia Supervisory Board; Islamic Finance Development; Bibliometric.

### **Article History**

Received: 5 November 2024 Revised: 2 December 2024 Accepted: 6 December 2024 Available online: 11 December 2024

This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-SA license (https://creativecommons.org/licen ses/by-nc-sa/4.0/)

### ABSTRACT

This study aims to map the intellectual structure of research regarding the role of the Sharia Supervisory Board (SSB) in the development of Islamic finance. This mapping includes bibliographic analysis, keywords, and a network map of research trends. This study uses the bibliometric method by utilizing the Biblioshiny and Vos Viewer analysis tools. The researcher used 315 articles published on the Scopus page from 1988–2023. The results show that in the last 10 years, a topic about SSB has received great attention from researchers with an increase in article production. This topic has been discussed by authors from Indonesia, Malaysia, and Bangladesh. The results of the study also show that there are five clusters consisting of the role of SSB in the implementation of shariah governance; the role of SSB in encouraging the development of Islamic finance; SSB in improving the performance of Islamic banking; the characteristics of SSB; and the leadership and political system. The results of this study guide researchers, practitioners, and policymakers to understand the direction and focus of the Sharia Advisory Council (SSB) research. Its practical implications include strengthening the conceptual foundation of the SSB, supporting the development of the Islamic finance industry, and potentially becoming the basis for the development of a new conceptual framework in the future.

\*Corresponding author: yusril-2023@feb.unair.ac.id

Cite this article as: Yusril, Rusanti, E., Zulaikha, S. (2024). Mapping Shariah Supervisory Board Literature for Islamic Finance Development. *Airlangga Journal of Innovation Management*, *5*(*4*), *555-574*. <u>https://doi.org/10.20473/ajim.v5i4.65038</u>

#### Introduction

The development of the Islamic finance industry in recent years has not only been fixed on the banking sector but has also begun to penetrate other sectors such as takaful, capital markets, and financial technology to the management of the social financial management (Badshah et al., 2021). This proves that the public's need for access to Sharia-based financial services is getting higher. Islamic finance adheres to Sharia law, prohibiting exploitative practices and emphasizing Islamic Corporate Governance. The main function of SSB, in addition to supervising and advising on the implementation of Islamic principles also plays the role of a guarantor of the Sharia credibility of a business entity which in turn increases customer trust in the transactions carried out (Nour Aldeen et al., 2022; Safiullah, 2023a). Initially, the presence of SSB was only required in the financial industry, especially banks that use Sharia management standards (Rahman Bayuny & Haron, 2023). However, in its development, the SSB of every business entity in all sectors, including public companies in the capital market, also requires the presence of an SSB as a requirement to become a Sharia issuer (Ismail et al., 2020a).

The presence of SSB can encourage development and innovation in a more holistic and sustainable financial sector (Archer & Idun, 2023a; Mukhibad, Jayanto, et al., 2022a). The growing needs and complexity of financial services problems for players in this sector to continue to open opportunities in developing their products. Even contemporary muamalah practices that no longer rely on single-contract products but switch to multiple-contract products certainly require more complex supervision and reasoning by SSB. Even with the emergence of digitized financial practices in the form of financial technology with various forms of products such as peer-to-peer lending and crowdfunding, the presence of SSB is still needed. Thus, the existence of SSB is important in encouraging the development of the Islamic financial landscape in the future.

This urgency is understood by researchers in various parts of the world and has become a research trend in recent years. The topic of SSB in the banking sphere is often explored in its role in the implementation of Shariah compliance (M. K. Alam et al., 2023; Hanif, 2018; Ismail et al., 2020b) Islamic corporate governance (M. K. Alam, Rahman, et al., 2022; Aljughaiman et al., 2023; Bashir & Babiker, 2023)financial performance (Abozaid, 2022; Akbar & Siti-Nabiha, 2022; Musleh Alsartawi, 2019) social performance disclosure (Ezzine, 2018; Pratama et al., 2022; Shittu et al., 2022) and product development (Archer & Idun, 2023b; Mukhibad et al., 2023) and fraud mitigation (Supriatna et al., 2022; Triyanto, 2022) and banking risk management (Ashraf & Lahsasna, 2017; Islamic & Box, 2022) Meanwhile, in other financial sectors, research on SSB is also widely discussed in other financial products and services such as sukuk (Aljughaiman et al., 2023b; Effendi et al., 2023) and stocks (Amina, 2015; Asunka et al., 2016)), financial technology (Tuyon et al., 2023) and microfinance (Agboklou & Özkan, 2023; Yusgiantoro et al., 2023) In addition, researchers also discuss a lot about the development of human development itself (Nawaz, 2019; So et al., 2023).

Mapping the intellectual structure of SSB research reveals trends, sources, and influential authors. This knowledge is crucial for future researchers to encourage SSB's role in Islamic financial development. So far, similar research that is bibliometric only discusses the implementation of Islamic corporate governance (Aspiranti et al., 2023; Pahlevi, 2023; Suhendar et al., 2023). The research is also only able to map the implementation of ICG limited to the banking sector and not in the development of Islamic finance. Meanwhile, bibliometric research focused on the role of SSB was not found in 315 scientific articles on similar topics published in the Scopus database. Thus, this research will provide a complete mapping of the development of literature over time, map the network of authors and journals, and identify the key concepts that dominate academic discussions. By using the bibliometric method, this study will also provide co-

occurrences or linkages between SSB research topics in recent years. so that the results of this study can guide researchers, practitioners, and policymakers in understanding the main direction and focus of SSB research. SSB research strengthens its foundation and supports Islamic finance industry development.

# Literature Review Shariah Supervisory Board

The Sharia Supervisory Board (SSB) is a key component of Islamic corporate governance, established to oversee the activities of Islamic Financial Institutions, ensuring their compliance with Shariah principles and maintaining alignment with Islamic business practices (K. Alam et al., 2019; Syarofi & Putri, 2023). In business in general, the presence of the board of directors and commissioners is sufficient to ensure the implementation of transparent and accountable transactions. However, in the context of Islamic business in any sector, it is necessary to add a portion of the council that understands the study of fiqh and muamalah professionally in carrying out its supervisory and coaching functions. SSB has the main function of supervising and advising bank managers and the board of directors to ensure compliance with Sharia principles in all banking transactions.

This is in line with (Safiullah, 2023b), who revealed that SSB, as a Sharia governance body, carries out three main roles: first, approving banking products and services following Sharia principles; second, guiding managers and directors in adapting innovations in transactions that are allowed according to Sharia; and third, conducting periodic audits of compliance with Sharia principles in banking transactions. SSB must also ensure full access and trust in knowledge and reports from all stakeholders of Islamic banks and the wider community (Abdul Latif et al., 2023; Migdad, 2017). This consists of the establishment of laws on banking activities, ex ante and ex post audits of transactions and financial instruments to certify Sharia compliance, which is the task of the Sharia Supervisory Board. Then calculate and pay zakat, dispose of income that is not in accordance with Sharia, and provide advice to consumers and shareholders regarding income distribution (Akbar & Siti-Nabiha, 2022; Isa et al., 2022).

Shariah Supervisory Boards (SSB) play a vital role in improving the financial and non-financial performance of Islamic financial institutions (IFIs). (Alshubiri & Al Ani, 2023; Badshah et al., 2021b) found that SSBs contribute to increased profitability by offering products and services that meet the Islamic financial needs of customers. On the other hand, SSBs ensure compliance with Shariah law through strict monitoring and supervision, a process that can slow down decision-making as every action must be carefully reviewed for Shariah compliance (Sueb et al., 2022b). Meanwhile, (Ezzine, 2018; Pratama et al., 2022; Shittu et al., 2022) revealed that SSB can also improve the transparency and disclosure of financial institutions' social performance. In fact, (Fadlur Rahman Bayuny & Haron, 2023) revealed that the integration of internal boards (directors and commissioners) with Sharia boards can increase the Sharia compliance of public companies in the capital market.

### **Islamic Financial Development**

Islamic finance is a sector focused on promoting economic growth by offering interest-free financial solutions and is increasingly developed in response to the growing public demand for Shariahcompliant transactions (Anwar, 2024; Naz & Gulzar, 2023). The development of Islamic finance, which initially only included the monetary system, especially banking, became one of the pillars of the economy in aggregate. However, currently, the offer of services and products provided is increasingly through various financing schemes that suit the financial needs of the wider community. Islamic finance grows annually at nearly 20 percent, driven by principles of equity and ownership. These characteristics align with key Islamic economic principles that emphasize the welfare of both the world and the hereafter, social justice, and balance in various economic aspects (Refinitiv, 2022; Syaifullah et al., 2024). Theoretically, Islamic finance is resilient to shocks due to its emphasis on risk-sharing, limitation on excessive risk-taking, and strong ties to real economic activities. However, Islamic financial institutions are not entirely immune to external economic shocks, such as fluctuations in gold and oil prices, which can affect their stability, considering these commodities are significant in many Islamic economies (Al-Aradi & Albalooshi, 2023).

(Sabiu & Abduh, 2020) revealed that the development of interest-free Islamic finance is more reliable and reliable when a crisis occurs because of its no dependence on the global banking interest ecosystem. Islamic finance relies on a check and balance mechanism, led by SSB to ensure compliance with Shariah principles by avoiding riba, gharar, and maysir in financial transactions. Its corporate governance also protects Islamic financial institutions from crises and minimizes turbulence. So the theoretical model underlying Islamic financial intermediation is more proven to be superior to the conventional model in terms of promoting equality, efficiency, and stability (Haldar et al., 2023; Saleem et al., 2021).

Islamic finance integrates Sharia principles into business operations, utilizing financial technology to reach the non-banking community (Sidaoui et al., 2022). Furthermore, the emergence of various financing schemes such as equity-based and debt-based funding is also carried out to meet the need for access to finance in large nominal terms in the long term. The presence of microfinance and Islamic social fund management institutions was also developed to reach unbankable people so that they can still access Islamic financial products. Islamic finance aims to create an inclusive environment and increase market share.

### Methodology

The author uses the bibliometric analysis approach in this article to conduct focused scientific investigations. Bibliometric analysis techniques can extract substantial information from published papers in a systematic manner. Bibliometrics make it easy to understand the topics covered in publications. Bibliometrics can evaluate large surveys using statistical methods (Donthu et al., 2021). Bibliometric analysis uses tools like Bibliometric and VOS Viewer to investigate authors, years, sources, and themes in previous works. Biblioshiny provides a graphical interface for non-programmers to perform detailed analyses and display findings in improved graphical representations.

Scopus database used for bibliometric analysis due to credible scientific journals, namely, first exploring publications related to the Shariah Supervisory Board in the Scopus database by searching using related keywords. As for this study, the keyword is used, "TITLE-ABS-KEY (shariah AND supervisory AND board) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY (shariah AND supervisory AND board) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY (shariah AND board))." As a result, in the first phase of data curation, 385 research articles were obtained. The data collection process began on January 21, 2024, by taking all documents for further analysis without special consideration of content and abstract. Furthermore, it enters the data screening stage by limiting several criteria, which include restricting the category of document type "Article," source type "Journal," and language "English," as well as the "final" publication stage. So that based on the results of this data screening process, a total of 315 publication articles were able to be collected by excluding 70 publications that did not fall into the desired criteria. The next stage is to identify scientific publication articles that have been collected related to the Sharia Supervisory Board or Sharia Council using predetermined analysis tools.





Source: Author (2024)

# **Results and Discussion Bibliography Analysis**

Based on the data collection and filtering process, it was found that 315 quality international journals became the main data in this study. As shown in Table 4.1, detailed general information about the results of the study. This publication data was obtained with a timespan from 1988 to 2023. 1988 is known as the year of the publication of the first article that correlates with the keywords studied. This article involves 139 journals with a total of 642 authors. Meanwhile, the growth of research production related to SSB in the world only reaches 4.57%, with an average of only 5 articles discussing this topic every year.

Description	Results
MAIN INFORMATION	N ABOUT DATA
Timespan	1988:2023
Sources (Journals, Books, etc.)	139
Documents	315
Annual Growth Rate %	4.57
Document Average Age	5.29
Average citations per doc	16.37
References	15584
DOCUMENT CO	ONTENTS
Keywords Plus (ID)	72
Author's Keywords (DE)	881
AUTHO	RS
Authors	642
Authors of single-authored docs	56
AUTHORS COLLA	BORATION
Single-authored docs	65
Co-Authors per Doc	2.68
International co-authorships%	29.52
DOCUMENT	TYPES
Article	315

### **Table 1 Main Information of Documents**

## **Annual Scientific Production**

Publication in the form of journal articles about SSB began in 1988 with the publication of a journal written by (Souryal, 1988) Furthermore, this study attracted the attention of the authors gradually from that year to 2013. Although only a few authors are interested in this topic, the growth of finance and the increasingly systematic Islamic financial system globally indirectly encourage researchers to conduct further research.



**Figure 2 Annual Scientific Production** 

Source: Biblioshiny (2024)

This can be seen from the last 10 years (2013-2023): research on SSB has increased significantly and peaked in 2022 with a total of 47 studies published in Scopus, followed by 2019 with 44 articles (see figure 4.1). Although SSB research in 2023 will decrease 2023, as seen from the number of articles of only 32, this research will gradually continue to develop considering the growing inclusive economy, which is also supported by the development of Islamic financial infrastructure and services.

Stepping on the activeness of researchers in citing articles about SSB during the exploration year is very important. This can indicate how much the implications of the articles in question are for the development of science, especially in the Islamic finance sector.



Figure 3 Annual Citation Per-year

Source: Biblioshiny (2024)

Based on Figure 4.2, in the 1988-2010 vulnerability, articles about SSB are still minimally cited by other studies. In the 24 years (1988–2012) since the publication of the first study, only an average of 17 documents have been cited every year. The increase in the average citations per year then began to increase in 2015, with a total average citation of 22 total citations. Despite fluctuations, in 2020-2023 journals on SSB have been cited more than an average of more than 30 citations every year.

However, if you look at the profiles per document, there are several articles that are references to many other publications. Where there are 10 articles with the most total citations. (Mollah & Zaman, 2015) obtained the most citations with a total of 323 citations, while (Mallin et al., 2014) and (Farook et al., 2011) obtained more than 200 citations.

Authors	Title	Total Citation
Mollah S.; Zaman M.	Sharia's supervision, corporate governance, and performance:	323
(2015)	conventional vs. Islamic banks	
Mallin C.; Farag H.; Ow-	Corporate social responsibility and financial performance in	237
Yong K. (2014)	Islamic banks	
Farook S.; Kabir Hassan	Determinants of corporate social responsibility disclosure: the	210
M.; Lanis R. (2011)	case of Islamic banks	

 Table 2 10 Top Cited Documents

Taib F.M.; Ramayah T.; Abdul Razak D. (2008)	Factors influencing intention to use diminishing partnership home financing	132
Rahman A.A.; Bukair	The influence of the Shariah supervision board on corporate	127
A.A. (2013)	social responsibility disclosure by Islamic banks of Gulf Co-	
	operation Council countries	
Safiullah M.; Shamsuddin	Risk in Islamic banking and corporate governance	109
A. (2018)		
Farag H.; Mallin C.; Ow-	Corporate governance in Islamic banks: New insights for dual	108
Yong K. (2018)	board structure and agency relationships	
Belal A.R.; Abdelsalam	Ethical Reporting in Islami Bank Bangladesh Limited (1983-	91
O.; Nizamee S.S. (2015)	2010)	
Quttainah M.A.; Song L.;	Do Islamic banks employ less earnings management?	91
Wu Q. (2013)		
Nomran N.M.; Haron R.;	Shari'ah supervisory board characteristics and effects on	83
Hassan R. (2018)	Islamic banks' performance: Evidence from Malaysia	

Source: Compiled by the Author (2024)

JIABR, IMEFM, and IJIF are the most published journals in Islamic economic research.



**Figure 4 Most Relevant Source** 

Source: Biblioshiny (2024)

However, there are also several non-Islamic journals that publish articles on the theme of SSB, such as Corporate Governance (Bingley) (10 articles), Asian Journal of Accounting Research (7 articles), and Banks and Bank Systems (7 articles). So that it can be an opportunity for authors who have an interest in this field to publish in reputable international journals.

In addition to identifying journal sources, you also analyze authors who have high productivity in conducting research on SSB throughout the year of observation. As shown in Table 4.3, the author who has the most SSB publications is MK (15 articles), then in second place is Haron (8 articles), while Grass and Outtaniah managed to publish 7 articles relevant to the topic of SSB and Shariah governance.

Table 3 20 Top Productive Authors					
Authors	Articles	Authors	Articles		
Alam MK	15	Aslam E	5		
Haron R	8	Hassan MK	5		
Grassa R	7	Karbhari Y	5		
Quttainah MA	7	Rahman MM	5		
Hassan AFS	6	Shafii Z	5		
Mukhibad H	6	Elnahass M	4		
Safiullah M	6	Kok SK	4		
Tabash Mi	6	Mustafa H	4		
Ahmed H	5	Thakur OA	4		
Almutairi AR	5	Amran AB	3		

Table 3 20 Top Productive Authors

Source: Biblioshiny (2024)

The authors come from a variety of different affiliations. University Putra Malaysia became the affiliate with the most articles published about SSB, namely 24 articles, followed by International Islamic University Malaysia (IIUM) with 22 articles. Meanwhile, Semarang State University is the third most affiliated. This shows that research on SSB is still dominated by Muslim countries, especially Malaysia and Indonesia. Interestingly, the University of Sfax UK emerged as one of the top 10 affiliates. This shows that the interest of researchers in this topic is also felt by researchers in non-Muslim countries as happened in the UK.



**Figure 5 Most Relevant Affiliation** 

Source: Biblioshiny (2024)

This research on SSB has proven to attract more and more attention from academics globally. This can be seen from the increasing collaboration of writers between countries. Based on our analysis, many collaborations are carried out in Muslim countries in the Asia-Pacific such as Malaysia, Indonesia and Bangladesh as well as Middle Eastern countries such as Saudi Arabia, Kuwait, Bahrain and the United Arab Emirates. Meanwhile, the authorship collaboration also involved non-Muslim countries that also conducted similar research found in the United Kingdom, Australia, the United States and China.



Figure 6 Collaboration World Map

Source: Biblioshiny (2024)

# **Document Analysis**

In this study, you also tried to map various specific topics related to research on SSB from 315 articles as the main data. If you look at it in general, it can be seen from World Cloud (Figure 4.6) that this study is closely related to the shariah supervisory board or SSB. While the sector most explored by previous research is still focused on Islamic banking and still does not show high interest in other Islamic financial sectors. In Word cloud, the names of countries that are commonly used as case studies in various studies, such as Malaysia, Bangladesh, and Indonesia, are also obtained.



Source: Biblioshiny (2024)

The specific topics discussed in various studies on SSB are further clarified in the treemap (figure 4.7) below. More than 10% of the articles discuss Islamic banks and corporate governance, while the rest discuss sharia governance in more depth (5%), Islamic finance (5%), and Shariah supervisory boards (4%). In addition, countries such as Malaysia (4%), Bangladesh (4%), Pakistan (1%), Bahrain (1%), and Indonesia (1%) are the most discussed countries related to the topic.



**Figure 8 Treemap** 

Source: Biblioshiny (2024)

Figures 4.8 and 4.9 show the evolution of trending topics throughout 1988-2023 regarding SSB. Although there are not many special themes raised, the issues of SSB in its role in Islamic financial institutions are increasingly attracting the attention of researchers. The most frequently discussed issues throughout the year are still dominated by sharia and *corporate governance* in Islamic banking for 5 years. This is shown by the thickening of the circle frame, which shows that the topic has been extensively researched before (see figure 4.8). While other themes that still need to be explored in more depth include Islamic financial institutions, which are more diverse, *Shariah auditors, corporate social responsibility,* and various other forms of disclosure.



Source: Biblioshiny (2024)

Interestingly, the evolution of these themes is increasingly diverse with the emergence of new discussions throughout 2020-2022. Where topics such as earnings management, risk-taking, intellectual capital, and dualism boards (shariah & director) are again widely looked at. In addition, other financial institutions, such as Takaful, have also begun to emerge as a new space for researchers to explore more deeply. Especially during the Covid-19 period, Islamic economic researchers seem to pay great attention to the issue of SSB (education & expertise) characteristics on the social performance of banking and regulatory changes that are a response to the phenomenon that occurred at that time.



Source: VOS Viewer (2024)

To better understand the direction of the theme's evolution movement, we then conducted a thematic analysis of the evolution map (Figure 4.9). This section serves to analyze the evolution of a theme or topic over time by comparing and tracking changes in the frequency, significance, and distribution of a particular topic or theme in the scientific literature. SSB research encompasses niche themes, such as motivational and religious factors, and emerging themes like shariah governance and Islamic accounting.



**Figure 11 Thematic Map Evolution** 

Source: Biblioshiny (2024)

*The basic quadrant*, which is a choice of research topics that are quite well-established and receive wide attention in the scientific literature, looks more diverse. Themes such as regulations, Islamic law, and issues that specifically occur in Islamic banking are the most common themes discussed in research on SSB. Interestingly, there is a discussion about *conventional banks* and *board size* in this quadrant, which indicates that there is an interest of researchers to conduct a comparative study of board performance between general boards (directors and commissioners) and sharia boards in Islamic banks and conventional banks. The last quadrant is *the motor theme*, which refers to research topics or themes that are currently receiving great attention and experiencing significant growth in the number of publications. Future research in SSB can explore board characteristics, earning management, and independence, as well as the evolution of SSB into Islamic financial institutions.



Figure 12 Research Theme: Keyword Analysis

Source: VOS Viewer (2024)

Bibliometric analysis uses clustering techniques to group documents based on characteristics, resulting in at least 5 clusters. The first cluster includes keywords related to Islamic corporate governance, while the second cluster focuses on Islamic finance and sharia principles. Islamic banking research explores SSB's role, performance, and characteristics, with clusters focusing on governance, education, and leadership. Research interest in Sharia gods in financial institutions has increased over the past decade. Research with this theme was first conducted by (Souryal, 1988), who analyzed the role of Sharia councils specifically appointed by the government to ensure the enforcement of Islamic law to reduce the crime rate in Saudi Arabia. Although it does not refer to financial institutions, this article explicitly provides an overview that the enforcement of Sharia laws can be carried out with the help of the supervision of Sharia councils. As time goes by, research on SSB continues to be carried out to encourage the development of Islamic financial institutions, with a total of 315 related articles involving 642 authors around the world. The results of clustering keywords show that several thematic networks have been and can be analyzed more deeply in the next study. The clusters are as follows:

# Shariah Board in the Implementation of Islamic Corporate Governance

The Sharia Council (SSB) has a great responsibility to ensure the implementation of aspects of religiosity that contribute to the resilience of the Islamic banking governance system and ratify the religious-

ethical legitimacy required by stakeholders (Haridan et al., 2018) The importance of implementing good governance will increase the value of the company and also the interests of shareholders through its influence on the cost of capital and profitability (Ismail et al., 2020b) For this reason, many researchers have conducted studies on the role of SSB in carrying out its function as one of the governance instruments in an institution, mainly in the Islamic finance sector. Research conducted by (Haridan et al., 2018) (Ismail et al., 2020b), and (Bashir & Babiker, 2023) empirically proves that the determination of the role of SSB is very large to ensure the realization of governance following Shariah compliance.

The implementation of effective governance will also improve institutional performance for the better. This is evidenced by (Mollah & Zaman, 2015) and (Farag et al., 2018) which are the most cited articles stating that the role of SSB can improve governance efficiency and at the same time be able to improve banking financial performance. SSB will provide added value to institutions and consumer trust so that they can make transactions and use services integrated with Islamic values. In fact, (Tashkandi, 2019) added that Sharia members directly affected the level of banking profitability. Corporate governance research should explore SSB's role, managerial aspects, and governance processes in various sectors.

### Shariah Board in the Development of Islamic Finance (Banking & Non-Bank)

It has become a common topic for researchers to analyze the role of SSB in the banking sector, including aspects of financial and non-financial performance. (Nomran et al., 2018) and (Hassan et al., 2022) found that the performance of banks and their operations will require the presence of SSB in certain numbers and characteristics. In addition, (Pratama et al., 2022) strengthened the role of SSB in increasing social disclosure and improving the quality of banking resources in Southeast Asia. Some of these studies clearly state that the correlation between SSB and banking performance is an inseparable part of each other.

To improve the development of Islamic finance, some researchers have also begun to penetrate other financial sectors, such as takaful. (Ibrahim et al., 2021) analyzed takaful risk management in Indonesia and found that the role of SSB is vital considering that takaful is often a guarantee for projects involving various parties and transactions in large nominals. Furthermore, (Al-Faryan & Alokla, 2023) also analyzed the role of SSB in takaful institutions in Saudi Arabia and found the same results where the author also emphasized that takaful involves rigid payment management so that SSB is needed to maintain the implementation of shariah compliance. Meanwhile, (Sulistiani & Tjahjadi, 2022) analyzed the development of Sukuk and SSB. Sharia supervisory boards support financial performance and Şukuk rating in Indonesia. Islamic finance strengthens institutions, particularly in microfinance.

### **Shariah Board Characteristics**

Based on the results of the clustering analysis, it was found that the research themes focused on the characteristics of the members of the Sharia council, such as education, experience, length of service, and the independence of the members themselves. Research conducted by (Sueb et al., 2022a) examined the reputation, number of members, education level, cross-membership, and SSB expertise on risk-taking and the implementation of sharia maqashid values in banks. High risk-taking can be effective if the SSB is qualified because a competent SSB can ensure that the risks are managed following the principles of sharia, maintain a balance between potential profits and compliance with ethics, and mitigate risks that are not following Islamic values. The results of the study indicate that SSB encourages higher risk-taking, which in turn improves the efficiency of Islamic banks and results in better financial performance. Meanwhile, another study, (Jamaludin & Bahaudin, 2022) saw a strong relationship between SSB characteristics in Sharia companies listed on the Stock Exchange and Shariah compliance by adding the variable of the

existence of women's boards. The study found a variety of results related to the characteristics of the board, including a women's board and total meetings with the performance of companies that are Shariahcompliant. Future research can explore the practical impact of SSB diversification on government policies and the characteristics of council members' vulnerability to Sharia risks.

#### Shariah Board Leadership & Political System

The Sharia Council not only plays an important role in supervising transaction practices and the enforcement of Sharia principles but also becomes the holder of institutional decisions and policy directions. The responsibilities of the Sharia board also support the existence of the board of directors, including in terms of setting the company's strategic goals, providing leadership to implement them, supervising business management, and reporting to shareholders on its management following Sharia principles (Htay & Salman, 2013). A more diverse board can contribute to greater leadership and general management oversight because the diversity of the board increases the independence of the board. In this view, the Sharia Council is used as an internal governance tool to monitor managers' behavior and the consistency of management policies. More specifically, Sharia Councils can play a key role in reducing organizational tensions by allowing leadership to disseminate initial information and publicly available information (Suhendar et al., 2023) SSB needs to demonstrate exemplary leadership, integrity, ability to manage good internal control policies, spirituality, and conducive organizational culture practices to show a more significant influence (So et al., 2023).

Shariah board leadership & political system has not been widely researched by writers in previous literature. Thus, there are research opportunities conducted in terms of the leadership role of SSB. Research on the role of SSB in conflict management in various financial institutions to create a conducive organizational climate. Researchers can also explore the strategic role of SSB in internal policymaking, deliberative democracy, and the role in overcoming power asymmetry (between companies and stakeholders).

### Conclusion

The role of the Sharia Supervisory Board (SSB) is very vital in overseeing the development of Islamic finance so it becomes necessary to be developed and explored more deeply through scientific research. The traces of the intellectual structure of SSB are currently increasingly in demand by researchers; as seen from 1988–2023, there are 315 Scopus articles discussing this topic with more than 600 authors. Although the author is still dominated in Islamic countries such as Malaysia and Indonesia, similar research has begun to emerge in non-Muslim countries such as the United Kingdom, which indicates that this topic is still globally relevant. Research topics that are often used in general discuss the Sharia Supervisory Board (SSB) itself, Shariah governance, Shariah compliance, and performance and are still focused on cases in Islamic banking. In its development, other financial institutions such as takaful and microfinance are also discussed, although they are still limited. Clustering analysis reveals five distinct themes related to Shariah Supervisory Boards (SSBs), including their role in Islamic finance and governance. This study contributes to bibliometric mapping and provides a foundation for future research. Research encourages SSB's role in Sharia principles, but limitations include keyword development and in-depth analysis. Future research can improve by adding analysis methods.

### **Author's Contribution**

Yusril collected data and wrote the manuscript, Ega Rusanti processed data and developed ideas, and Siti Zulaikha proofread and provided guidance.

### Acknowledgments

The authors thank contributors and the AJIM editorial team for enhancing article quality.

### **Declaration of Competing Interest**

The researcher confirms no conflicts of interest.

### Fundings

This study did not receive any funding.

### Reference

- Abdul Latif, R., Taufil Mohd, K. N., Kamardin, H., & Mohd Ariff, A. H. (2023). Determinants of Sustainability Disclosure Quality among Plantation Companies in Malaysia. Sustainability (Switzerland), 15(4), 1–23. <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/su15043799</u>
- Abozaid, A. (2022). Economic and Shariah Considerations in Debt Financing. *Journal of King Abdulaziz University, Islamic Economics*, 35(3). <u>https://doi.org/10.4197/Islec.35-3.8</u>
- Agboklou, K. E., & Özkan, B. (2023). Determinants of the financial performance and sustainability of microfinance institutions in Togo. *Sosyal Ekonomik Araştırmalar Dergisi*, 23(1), 1–11. <u>https://doi.org/10.30976/susead.1078784</u>
- Akbar, T., & Siti-Nabiha, A. K. (2022). Objectives and measures of performance of Islamic microfinance banks in Indonesia: the stakeholders' perspectives. *ISRA International Journal of Islamic Finance*, 14(2), 124–140. <u>https://doi.org/10.1108/IJIF-11-2020-0231</u>
- Alam, K., Rahman, S. A., Mustafa, H., Shah, S. M., & Hossain, S. (2019). Shariah governance framework of Islamic banks in Bangladesh: Practices, problems and recommendations. *International Journal of English Language and Literature Studies*, 9(1), 118–132. https://doi.org/10.18488/journal.aefr.2019.91.118.132
- Alam, M. K., Rahman, M. M., Runy, M. K., Adedeji, B. S., & Hassan, M. F. (2022). The influences of Shariah governance mechanisms on Islamic banks performance and Shariah compliance quality. *Asian Journal of Accounting Research*, 7(1), 2–16. <u>https://doi.org/10.1108/AJAR-11-2020-0112</u>
- Alam, M. K., Tabash, M. I., Thakur, O. A., Rahman, M. M., Siddiquii, M. N., & Hasan, S. (2023). Independence and effectiveness of Shariah department officers to ensure Shariah compliance: evidence from Islamic banks in Bangladesh. *Asian Journal of Accounting Research*, 8(1), 15–26. https://doi.org/10.1108/AJAR-01-2022-0022
- Al-Aradi, A., & Albalooshi, S. (2023). Resilience of Islamic Banks in Bahrain: A Comparative Study of the 2007 Global Financial Crisis and the Covid-19 Pandemic. 2023 International Conference on Sustainable Islamic Business and Finance, SIBF 2023, 355–360. https://doi.org/10.1109/SIBF60067.2023.10380051
- Al-Faryan, M. A. S., & Alokla, J. (2023). Do Publicly Listed Insurance Firms in Saudi Arabia Have Strong Corporate Governance? *Economies*, 11(1), 1–41. <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/economies11010021</u>
- Aljughaiman, A., Salama, A., & Verousis, T. (2023). Corporate governance, Shari'ah governance and financial flexibility: Evidence from the MENA region. *International Journal of Finance and Economics*, April 2021, 1–20. <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/ijfe.2878</u>
- Alshubiri, F., & Al Ani, M. K. (2023). Financing and returns of Shari'ah-compliant contracts and sustainable investing in the Islamic banking of Oman. In *Economic Change and Restructuring* (Vol. 56, Issue 4). Springer US. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10644-023-09522-8</u>

- Amina, H. (2015). Dividend policy and corporate governance in saudi stock market: Outcome model or substitute model? *Corporate Ownership and Control*, 12(2), 74–91. https://doi.org/10.22495/cocv12i2p7
- Anwar, M. (2024). The Impact of Islamic Financial Deepening on Economic Growth in Indonesia. *Airlangga Journal of Innovation Management*, 5(1), 78–90. <u>https://doi.org/10.20473/AJIM.V5I1.51402</u>
- Archer, C., & Idun, A. A. (2023a). Financial outreach, financial innovation, and sustainable development in Africa. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 30(26), 69393–69415. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/S11356-023-27304-7/TABLES/5</u>
- Ashraf, M. A., & Lahsasna, A. (2017). Proposal for a new Sharīʿah risk rating approach for Islamic banks. *ISRA International Journal of Islamic Finance*, 9(1), 87–94. <u>https://doi.org/10.1108/ijif-07-2017-008</u>
- Aspiranti, T., Ali, Q., Parveen, S., Amaliah, I., Jalil, M. A., & Merican, F. M. I. (2023). Bibliometric Review of Corporate Governance of Islamic Financial Institutions Through Ai-Based Tools. *International Journal of Professional Business Review*, 8(4), 1–30. <u>https://doi.org/10.26668/businessreview/2023.v8i4.1710</u>
- Asunka, B. A., Glover-Akpey, I., & Azembila, A. B. (2016). The Effect of Audit Committees on the Performance of Firms Listed on the Ghana Stock Exchange. Article in IOSR Journal of Business and Management, 18(11), 55–62. <u>https://doi.org/10.9790/487X-1811055562</u>
- Badshah, Y. A., Abdullah, Hashmi, M. A., & Shah, M. H. (2021a). Board oversight and financial performance of islamic banks in Arab and non-Arab countries. *International Journal of Business and Society*, 22(3), 1384–1401. https://doi.org/10.33736/IJBS.4310.2021
- Bashir, M. S., & Babiker, A. A. (2023). Evaluation of Sharī'ah Governance Practices in Saudi Arabian Banks. *Malaysian Journal of Syariah and Law*, 11(2), 243–270. https://doi.org/10.33102/mjsl.vol11no2.480
- Donthu, N., Kumar, S., Mukherjee, D., Pandey, N., & Lim, W. M. (2021). How to conduct a bibliometric analysis: An overview and guidelines. *Journal of Business Research*, *133*, 285–296. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.JBUSRES.2021.04.070
- Effendi, J., Qoyum, A., Wardhana, L. I., & Thaker, H. M. T. (2023). IT investment and Islamic banking performance in Indonesia: Do Sukuk issuance and Sariah governance matter? *Banks and Bank Systems*, *18*(2), 75–87. <u>https://doi.org/10.21511/bbs.18(2).2023.07</u>
- Ezzine, H. (2018). Corporate governance and social norms during financial crisis: evidence from France and Saudi Arabia. *Journal of Management and Governance*, 22(3), 707–748. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10997-017-9400-x</u>
- Fachrurrozie, Nurkhin, A., Wahyudin, A., Kholid, A. M., & Agustina, I. (2021). The effect of profitability, size and Shariah supervisory board of an Indonesian Islamic bank on the Islamic social reporting disclosure. *Banks and Bank Systems*, 16(3), 84–92. <u>https://doi.org/10.21511/bbs.16(3).2021.08</u>
- Fadlur Rahman Bayuny, A., & Haron, R. (2023). Board structure, ownership structure, and capital structure: Empirical evidence on Shariah and non-Shariah compliant firms in Indonesia. *Banks and Bank Systems*, 18(4), 241–254. <u>https://doi.org/10.21511/bbs.18(4).2023.20</u>
- Farag, H., Mallin, C., & Ow-Yong, K. (2018). Corporate governance in Islamic banks: New insights for dual board structure and agency relationships. *Journal of International Financial Markets, Institutions* and Money, 54, 59–77. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.intfin.2017.08.002</u>
- Farook, S., Kabir Hassan, M., & Lanis, R. (2011). Determinants of corporate social responsibility disclosure: the case of Islamic banks. *Journal of Islamic Accounting and Business Research*, 2(2), 114–141. <u>https://doi.org/10.1108/17590811111170539</u>
- Haldar, A., Sucharita, S., Dash, D. P., Sethi, N., & Chandra Padhan, P. (2023). The effects of ICT, electricity consumption, innovation and renewable power generation on economic growth: An income level

analysis for the emerging economies. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 384(December 2022), 135607. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2022.135607

- Hanif, M. (2018). Sharī ah-compliance ratings of the Islamic financial services industry: a quantitative approach. *ISRA International Journal of Islamic Finance*, *10*(2), 162–184. https://doi.org/10.1108/IJIF-10-2017-0038
- Haridan, N. M., Hassan, A. F. S., & Karbhari, Y. (2018). Governance, religious assurance and Islamic banks: Do Shariah boards effectively serve? *Journal of Management and Governance*, 22(4), 1015– 1043. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10997-018-9418-8</u>
- Hassan, A., Sohail, M. S., & Munshi, M. M. R. (2022). Sharī ah governance and agency dynamics of Islamic banking operations in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia. *ISRA International Journal of Islamic Finance*, 14(1), 89–106. https://doi.org/10.1108/IJIF-12-2020-0252
- Htay, S. N. N., & Salman, S. A. (2013). Balanced score card approach for better Shari'Ah corporate governance. American Journal of Applied Sciences, 10(12), 1553–1557. https://doi.org/10.3844/ajassp.2013.1553.1557
- Ibrahim, M. A., Mat Nor, A., & Raja Hisham, R. R. I. (2021). Factors influencing Bumiputera contractors' acceptance of the contractor's all risk takāful product. *ISRA International Journal of Islamic Finance*, 13(3), 364–377. <u>https://doi.org/10.1108/IJIF-09-2020-0188</u>
- Isa, M., Lee, S. P., Bacha, O. I., & Ahmad, R. (2022). Some thoughts on resetting the roles and functions of Sharī ah committees of Islamic banks in Malaysia. *ISRA International Journal of Islamic Finance*, 14(2), 175–189. https://doi.org/10.1108/IJIF-05-2021-0096
- Islamic, I., & Box, P. O. (2022). SHARĪ 'AH RISK MANAGEMENT PRACTICES IN MALAYSIAN ISLĀMIC BANKS Noraini Mohd Ariffin Department of Accounting, Kulliyyah of Economics and Management The Islāmic Financial Services Board (2005) stated that Sharī 'ah non- compliance risk arises from Islāmic. 1(1), 101–123.
- Ismail, A. M., Ismail, C. R., Sulaiman, S., & Daud, D. (2020a). Corporate Governance and Firm Risk: Evidence from Malaysian Shariah Compliance Companies. *Humanities and Social Sciences Letters*, 8(2), 169–193. https://doi.org/10.18488/JOURNAL.73.2020.82.169.193
- Jamaludin, M. F., & Bahaudin, M. F. (2022). Board Characteristics and Company Performance: A Study of Shariah-Compliant Public Listed Companies in Malaysia. *Global Business and Management Research: An International Journal Vol.*, 14(3s), 1559–1585.
- Mallin, C., Farag, H., & Ow-Yong, K. (2014). Corporate social responsibility and financial performance in Islamic banks. *Journal of Economic Behavior and Organization*, 103(March 2013), S21–S38. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jebo.2014.03.001</u>
- Migdad, A. M. (2017). CSR practices of Palestinian Islamic banks: contribution to socio-economic development. ISRA International Journal of Islamic Finance, 9(2), 133–147. <u>https://doi.org/10.1108/ijif-06-2017-0001</u>
- Mollah, S., & Zaman, M. (2015). Shari'ah supervision, corporate governance and performance: Conventional vs. Islamic banks. *Journal of Banking and Finance*, 58, 418–435. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbankfin.2015.04.030</u>
- Mukhibad, H., Jayanto, P. Y., Jati, K. W., & Khafid, M. (2022). Attributes of Shariah Supervisory Board and shariah compliance. *Corporate Governance and Organizational Behavior Review*, 6(3), 173. <u>https://doi.org/10.22495/CGOBRV6I3P16</u>
- Mukhibad, H., Nurkhin, A., Anisykurlillah, I., Fachrurrozie, F., & Jayanto, P. Y. (2023). Open innovation in shariah compliance in Islamic banks – Does shariah supervisory board attributes matter? *Journal* of Open Innovation: Technology, Market, and Complexity, 9(1), 100014. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joitmc.2023.100014</u>

- Musleh Alsartawi, A. (2019). Performance of Islamic banks Do the frequency of Sharī ah supervisory board meetings and independence matter? *ISRA International Journal of Islamic Finance*, *11*(2), 303–321. https://doi.org/10.1108/ijif-05-2018-0054
- Nawaz, T. (2019). Exploring the Nexus Between Human Capital, Corporate Governance and Performance: Evidence from Islamic Banks. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 157(2), 567–587. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10551-017-3694-0</u>
- Naz, S. A., & Gulzar, S. (2023). Islamic financial development & economic growth: the emergence of Islamic financial market in Pakistan. *Journal of Islamic Accounting and Business Research*, 14(6), 989–1012. <u>https://doi.org/10.1108/JIABR-09-2022-0222</u>
- Nomran, N. M., Haron, R., & Hassan, R. (2018). Shari'ah supervisory board characteristics effects on Islamic banks' performance: Evidence from Malaysia. *International Journal of Bank Marketing*, 36(2), 290–304. https://doi.org/10.1108/IJBM-12-2016-0197
- Nour Aldeen, K., Ratih, I. S., & Sari Pertiwi, R. (2022). Cash waqf from the millennials' perspective: a case of Indonesia. *ISRA International Journal of Islamic Finance*, 14(1), 20–37. https://doi.org/10.1108/IJIF-10-2020-0223/FULL/PDF
- Pahlevi, R. W. (2023). Mapping of Islamic corporate governance research: a bibliometric analysis. *Journal* of Islamic Accounting and Business Research, 14(4), 538–553. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1108/JIABR-12-2021-0314
- Pratama, B. C., Kamaluddin, A., & Saad, S. (2022). Social Performance of Islamic Banks in South-East Asia: Is Intellectual Capital and Sharia Supervisory Boards Matters? *Quality Access to Success*, 23(186), 141–150. https://doi.org/10.47750/QAS/23.186.18
- Rahman Bayuny, A. F., & Haron, R. (2023). Board structure, ownership structure, and capital structure: Empirical evidence on Shariah and non-Shariah compliant firms in Indonesia. *Banks and Bank Systems*, 18(4), 241–254. <u>https://doi.org/10.21511/BBS.18(4).2023.20</u>
- Refinitiv. (2022). Refinitiv Islamic Finance Development Report 2022. LSEG Business, 80.
- Ridha, M., & Umiyati, U. (2022). Sharia Compliance, Islamic Corporate Governance dan Non Performing Financing Terhadap Pengungkapan Fraud Bank Umum Syariah. *Jurnal Akuntansi Dan Governance*, 3(1), 1. <u>https://doi.org/10.24853/jago.3.1.1-16</u>
- Sabiu, T. T., & Abduh, M. (2020). Islamic Financial Development and Economic Growth in Nigeria: a Bounds Testing Approach. *Journal of Islamic Monetary Economics and Finance*, 6(3), 597–620. <u>https://doi.org/10.21098/jimf.v6i3.1191</u>
- Safiullah, M. (2023a). Funding liquidity in Islamic banks: Does the Shariah supervisory board's higher educational attainment matter? *Pacific-Basin Finance Journal*, 78, 101976. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/J.PACFIN.2023.101976</u>
- Saleem, A., Sági, J., & Setiawan, B. (2021). Islamic financial depth, financial intermediation, and sustainable economic growth: ARDL approach. *Economies*, 9(2), 1–22. https://doi.org/10.3390/economies9020049
- Sheikh, R., Ayaz, M., & Siddique, M. A. (2023). Sharīʿah Governance and Sharīʿah Non-Compliance Risk Management: A Maqāsid Sharīʿah Based Appraisal. *Journal of Islamic Thought and Civilization*, 13(1), 270–291. <u>https://doi.org/10.32350/jitc.131.19</u>
- Shittu, A. D., Ismail, S. F., & Ndaman, M. N. (2022). Shariah and Social Reconstructions in Northern Nigeria: Evidence From Niger State Zakat and Endowment Board (2001-2017). *Malaysian Journal* of Syariah and Law, 10(2), 16–25. <u>https://doi.org/10.33102/mjsl.vol10no2.347</u>
- Sidaoui, M., Ben Bouheni, F., Arslankhuyag, Z., & Mian, S. (2022). Fintech and Islamic banking growth: new evidence. *Journal of Risk Finance*, 23(5), 535–557. https://doi.org/10.1108/JRF-03-2022-0049

- So, I. G., Haron, H., Gui, A., Princes, E., & Sari, S. A. (2023). Human Governance Development Index of Shariah Compliant Companies in Malaysia and Indonesia. WSEAS Transactions on Business and Economics, 20, 611–618. <u>https://doi.org/10.37394/23207.2023.20.56</u>
- Souryal, S. (1988). The Role of Shariah Law in Deterring Criminality in Saudi-Arabia. *International Journal of Comparative and Applied Criminal Justice*, 12(1–2), 1–25. https://doi.org/10.1080/01924036.1988.9688875
- Sueb, M., Prasojo, Muhfiatun, Syarifah, L., & Putra, R. N. A. (2022a). The effect of shariah board characteristics, risk-taking, and maqasid shariah on an Islamic bank's performance. *Banks and Bank Systems*, 17(3), 89–101. <u>https://doi.org/10.21511/bbs.17(3).2022.08</u>
- Suhendar, Zulfikar, R., Bastian, E., & Hanifah, I. A. (2023). Trend of the Research on Islamic Corporate Governance in Islamic Banking: A Bibliometric Analysis. *Journal of Law and Sustainable Development*, 11(9), e1468. <u>https://doi.org/10.55908/sdgs.v11i9.1468</u>
- Sulistiani, D., & Tjahjadi, B. (2022). Does Financial Performance Mediate the Effect of Good Corporate Governance on Indonesian Şukūk Rating? *Journal of King Abdulaziz University, Islamic Economics*, 35(2), 97–114. <u>https://doi.org/10.4197/Islec.35-2.6</u>
- Supriatna, A., Umiyati, & Kamal, M. (2022). The Influence of Sharia Compliance and Islamic Corporate Governance on Fraud. *ITQAN: Journal of Islamic Economics, Management, and Finance*, 1(2), 68– 80. <u>https://doi.org/10.57053/itqan.v1i2.12</u>
- Syaifullah, Heriangrum, S., Damirah, Lestari, N. P., & Hudaifah, A. (2024). Factors Influencing Economic Growth in OIC Countries: A Panel Data Approach. *Airlangga Journal of Innovation Management*, 5(2), 291–305. <u>https://doi.org/10.20473/AJIM.V5I2.57640</u>
- Syarofi, M., & Putri, L. (2023). The Importance of Sharia Supervisory Board on Islamic Financial Institution. Airlangga Journal of Innovation Management, 4(1), 74–83. <u>https://doi.org/10.20473/AJIM.V4I1.45357</u>
- Tashkandi, A. A. (2019). The impact of governance mechanisms on profitability of Islamic banks in the GCC countries during 2005-2016. *Journal of King Abdulaziz University, Islamic Economics*, 32(3), 163–190. <u>https://doi.org/10.4197/Islec.32-3.10</u>
- Triyanto, D. (2022). Sharia Compliance, Islamic Corporate Governance, and Fraud: A study of Sharia Banks in Indonesia. *Journal of Intelligence Studies in Business*, 12(1), 34–43. https://doi.org/10.37380/JISIB.V12I1.925
- Tuyon, J., Onyia, O. P., Ahmi, A., & Huang, C. H. (2023). Sustainable financial services: reflection and future perspectives. *Journal of Financial Services Marketing*, 28(4), 664–690. <u>https://doi.org/10.1057/s41264-022-00187-4</u>
- Yusgiantoro, I., Pamungkas, P., & Trinugroho, I. (2023). The sustainability and performance of Bank Wakaf Mikro: waqf-based microfinance in Indonesia. *International Journal of Islamic and Middle Eastern Finance and Management*, 86–101. <u>https://doi.org/10.1108/IMEFM-06-2022-0233</u>
- Zaki, A., Sholihin, M., & Barokah, Z. (2014). The association of Islamic bank ethical identity and financial performance: evidence from Asia. *Asian Journal of Business Ethics*, *3*(2), 97–110. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s13520-014-0034-7</u>