Biokultur, Volume 11, Number 1, 2022, Page 28-44

Between the Sustainable Development Narrative and the Environmental Crisis: Analysis of School Textbooks in Indonesia

Antara Narasi Pembangunan Berkelanjutan dan Krisis Lingkungan: Analisis Buku Ajar Sekolah di Indonesia

Ganes Gunansyah
Departement of Primary Teacher Education, Faculty of Education, Universitas Negeri Surabaya,
Address: Jl. Lidah Wetan, Lidah Wetan, Kec. Lakarsantri, Kota SBY, Jawa Timur 60213
Email: ganesgunansyah@unesa.ac.id

Abstract
This study aims to find out what narratives of sustainable development are dominant and what is limited to the presentation of the contents of elementary school textbooks in Indonesia. This study uses quantitative and descriptive content analysis with an instrument in an analysis sheet based on theory. The data sources are 51 elementary thematic textbooks from grades one to six. The study results show that the concept of sustainable development (SDGs) consists of 17 goals and education for sustainable development (ESD). These aspects include social, environmental, economic Sustainability, inclusive development, generally widely spread across all grade levels with varying portions in each grade. The distribution of material related to Social Sustainability (SS) and Environmental Sustainability (EnS) aspects is presented in a small and limited percentage. Meanwhile, materials about aspects of Economic Sustainability (ES) and Sustainability of Inclusive Development (SID) have the most significant portion. Materials on economic growth and activities and the use of natural resources as the mainstay of sustainable development are still dominant, while the roots of the environmental crisis and prevention of ecological damage are still missing.

Keywords: Sustainable Development Goals, Education for Sustainable Development, Textbooks, Environmental Crisis

Abstrak
Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengetahui narasi pembangunan berkelanjutan apa yang dominan dan apa yang terbatas pada penyajian isi buku teks sekolah dasar di Indonesia. Penelitian ini menggunakan analisis isi kuantitatif dan deskriptif dengan instrumen berupa lembar analisis berdasarkan teori. Sumber data adalah 51 buku teks tematik SD dari kelas satu sampai enam. Hasil studi menunjukkan bahwa konsep pembangunan berkelanjutan (SDGs) terdiri dari 17 tujuan dan pendidikan untuk pembangunan berkelanjutan (ESD). Aspek-aspek tersebut meliputi sosial, lingkungan, ekonomi Keberlanjutan, pembangunan inklusif, umumnya tersebar luas di semua tingkatan kelas dengan porsi yang bervariasi di setiap kelas. Penyampaian materi terkait aspek Social Sustainability (SS) dan Environmental Sustainability (EnS) disajikan dalam persentase yang kecil dan terbatas. Sedangkan materi tentang aspek Economic Sustainability (ES) dan Sustainability of Inclusive Development (SID) memiliki porsi paling signifikan. Materi tentang pertumbuhan dan kegiatan ekonomi serta pemanfaatan sumber daya alam sebagai andalan pembangunan berkelanjutan masih dominan, sedangkan akar krisis lingkungan dan pencegahan kerusakan ekologi masih hilang.

***Kata kunci**: Tujuan Pembangunan Berkelanjutan, Pendidikan untuk Pembangunan Berkelanjutan, Buku Ajar, Krisis Lingkungan*

Introduction

Education is one of the agendas carried out as the core of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) strategy to encourage capacity building and the education process in strengthening community capacity for sustainable action (Westphal et al., 2018). This program aims to make it applicable in schools that are integrated into the plans, curriculum, and educational standards framework and emphasize the three aspects of environment, economy, and social (Wals, 2012). In education, the sustainable development aspect is further focused through the implementation of

Education for Sustainable Development (ESD), which emphasizes cognitive, affective, and behavioral responses (Berglund et al., 2014). There are three main themes in ESD, namely the educational environment, policies for implementing the SDGs, and the principles of responsible education management (Avelar et al., 2019). Educational practices are believed to provide interventions in environmental and biodiversity conservation efforts (Harring et al., 2017).

But on the other hand, the idea of the concept of ESD presents criticism. The hegemonic practice of the current development paradigm through growth has increased inequality and pressure on natural resources, exacerbated the loss of biodiversity climate change, and resulted in social tensions (Kopnina, 2020). In teaching critical literacy (pedagogical literacy), emphasize the need to reinvent environmental pedagogy to focus on 'reading' the development framework through the questions 'What is development for?', 'For whom?', and 'What are the motives behind it? (Misiaszek, 2020). The practice of neoliberalism still dominates how we think about the world, including what should be and shouldn't be (dream or perceived), including in environmental education, which often unwittingly limits our thoughts, feelings, and actions to us both as educators and researchers (Hursh et al., 2015). This seems to be the marginalization of the environmental risk approach in practice and testing in schools. The writings of David Orr, quoted by Payne et al. (2020) in his book "the missing politics of environmental education," identify various absences, silences, or gaps in environmental education. Through an examination of critical pedagogy, one can allow oneself to understand how hope can be incorporated in an organized manner and explain the role that hope can and should play in academic and social life in rejecting a universal vision (Giroux, 2015).

Social and ecological disasters due to unsustainable exploitation of nature (economic incentives, politics, law enforcement) and destructive cultural practices are increasing. Therefore, a more critical form of literacy is needed towards mainstream lifestyles and dominant social structures. The technocratic standards movement in education masquerading as "green" promotion is noteworthy as greenwash. Jickling (2005) has been concerned about the many forms of instrumentalist and deterministic education for sustainable development discourse. According to him, ESD only treats educational content as a mere method rather than a participatory-collective action to prevent and save environmental crimes. Neoliberal market mechanisms and visions of sustainable development that still emphasize economic trade are considered foxes who are given the task of guarding chicken coops (Kahn, 2010).

In the curriculum, the environment is often described as a resource available for human exploitation, for example, in the field of Economics (Parker et al., 2019). Presenting the environment as a resource for human exploitation and facilitating the understanding that humans have the right to treat nature as they please is one of the root causes of ecological damage (Stibbe, 2004). The national curriculum is a product of the state. It can be read as a statement of what is desired for the knowledge of its citizens and how they want their citizens to develop so that it is great potential for the state (and its government) to spread its ideology (Parker et al., 2019). The national school curriculum usually presents a choice of knowledge, fixed and stable values , and universal truths, which the state considers necessary for its citizens to learn. Not surprisingly, they usually aim to create ideal citizens, who are loyal and patriotic and embody the nation's aspirations, and Indonesia shares this goal with most countries. This is often, but not always, a process of indoctrination. In the context of education in Indonesia, one of the components supporting the

implementation of the 2013 Curriculum is through the presence of textbooks published directly by the Ministry of Education and Culture. Leigh (1991) accurately describes school culture under a regime as "textbook culture," and even today, teachers rely heavily on textbooks, where for the most part, subjects are produced by independent authors based on prescribed curriculum documents.

The purpose of this research is to find out how the relative importance of SDGs and ESD content is presented in the curriculum, especially through textbooks, it can be seen by calculating the frequency of occurrence of these aspects in the distribution of themes and presentation of the material. What themes and materials are dominantly presented, and what themes are limited or even deliberately limited or even eliminated. Many researchers have discussed the implementation of SDGs and ESD in schools. Still, in the context of Indonesia, there has been no specific study that has identified and mapped the distribution of aspects of sustainable development included in the themes in thematic textbooks in elementary schools and how they are integrated into the cognitive dimension. Effective and action. Therefore, this article is expected to fill the limitations of the study of how the concept of growth and development is inserted in thematic textbooks in elementary schools in Indonesia to reproduce ideology in the curriculum and educational practice.

Method

This research uses quantitative descriptive research with content analysis. The data source contains the subject and object of study. The issue of the study is the 2013 Curriculum thematic textbook published by the Indonesian Ministry of Education and Culture starting from grade I to grade VI, with a total of 51 books. The object of research is the content of themes and materials on aspects of sustainable development, including social, environmental, economic, and inclusive growth and their integration into the learning dimension, which consists of the cognitive, affective, and action dimensions. Following its characteristics, this study aims to identify the themes and substance of the sustainable development aspects (SDGs and ESD) in textbooks in a systematic, objective, valid, and reliable manner as the basis for conclusions that reflect the overall contents of the book. The instrument used is a content analysis sheet adjusted based on the relevant theoretical references. To obtain objective results using internal and external validity and reliability. The research stages include determining the formulation of the problem, literature study, unit of observation and unit of analysis, samples, and variables, making categorization and purification guidelines, data collection, data coding, processing, and interpretation. Data analysis used a distribution table to determine the unit of frequency, average, and proportion by comparing each score at all frequencies in the form of a percentage.

Table 1. List of Thematic Textbooks

No.	Grade	Number of Books	Number of Themes	Number of Sub-Theme
1	One	8	8	32
2	Two	8	8	32
3	Three	8	8	32
4	Four	9	9	27
5	Five	9	9	33
6	Six	9	9	37
Total number		51	51	193

Table 2. List of Thematic Textbooks Aspects of Sustainable Development

Class	Theme	The material of sustainable aspects															%
		ES	EnS	SS	SID	ES - EnS	ES - SS	ES - SID	EnS – SS	EnS – SID	SS - SID	ES – EnS - SS	ES – EnS- SID	ES – SS - SID	EnS – SS- SID	EnS – ES – SS	

Note:

Social Sustainability (SS)
Environmental Sustainability (EnS)
Economic Sustainability (ES)
Sustainability of Inclusive Development (SID)

Results

Based on the analysis obtained from thematic textbooks starting from grade I to grade VI, we found that the concepts of sustainable development (SDGs) and education for sustainable development (ESD) are generally spread across all grade levels with varying portions in each grade. The SS aspect has the highest percentage (53%), followed by EnS, ES, and SID, as shown in Table 4.

Table 4. Content Distribution of Sustainability Aspects

No.	Sustainable Development Aspects	Item	%
1	Social Sustainability (SS)	611	53
2	Environmental Sustainability (EnS)	278	24
3	Economic Sustainability (ES)	174	15
4	Sustainability of Inclusive Development (SID)	93	8
Total number		1,156	100

The aspect of Social Sustainability

Each aspect of SS is listed in the six sustainable development goals, as presented in Table 5.

Table 5. Aspects of Social Sustainability

Goal	Indicator	%	Class and Learning Theme(s)
G-1	Equality of access to meet the life necessities	2	1 (6), 3 (1,4,6); 4 (8)
	Poor people's resilience to climate, economic, social, environmental shocks and how to protect the environment	0.1	5 (4)
G-2	End hunger and ensure access for all people	1	1 (1), 3 (1.6)
	End all forms of malnutrition	2	1 (1), 3 (1,4)
	Double the agricultural productivity and income of small-scale food producers	1	3 (2,4,7)
	The sustainable food production system	0.1	3 (1.7)
	Maintaining the genetic diversity of seeds	13	1 (7); 2 (6); 3 (1,2,4,5); 4 (3,4,8,9); 5 (2,5); 6 (1,2,8)
G-3	End epidemic infectious diseases	0.1	3 (6)
	Reducing one-third of premature deaths	1	2 (4); 3 (1,4); 5 (4)
	Ensuring universal access to sexual and reproductive health services	3	1 (1), 6 (6,7)
	Reducing mortality and disease caused by chemicals	0.1	3 (1)
G-4	Ensure that everyone who learns gets the knowledge and expertise needed to support sustainable development	69	1 (1,2,3,4,5,6,8); 2 (1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8); 3 (2,5,6,7,8); 4 (1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9); 5 (1,2,3,4,5,6,7,9); 6 (1,2,3,4,5,6,7,9)
G-5	End all forms of discrimination against all women and girls	0.1	5 (7)
	Appreciate unpaid domestic work and services through the provision of public services	0.1	3 (4)
	Ensuring that all women participate fully and get equal opportunities for leadership	0.1	5 (7)
G-6	Ensuring universal access to sexual and reproductive health	1	4 (7)
	Achieve equitable universal access to drinking water	1	3 (1); 5 (8)
	Achieve access to proper and fair sanitation and hygiene	0.1	5 (5)
	Improve water quality by reducing pollution	1	2 (1); 5 (8)
	Substantially increasing water usage efficiently	1	1 (8), 3 (1.6); 5 (8)
	Implement water resource management through PDAM (Local water company), wells, and rivers	0.1	5 (8)
	Protect and improve aquatic ecosystems	1	3 (6); 5 (8)

Based on table 5, there are six SDGs goals stated in the textbook. The distribution of materials related to no poverty (G-1), zero hunger (G-2), good health and well-being (G-3), gender equality (G-5), clean water, and sanitation (G-6) has been presented. A minimal portion of only 3% on average. Only quality education (G-4) has the most significant part of 69%. G-1 (end poverty in any form) is contained through the material on the poor related to climate change, and its economic, social, environmental, and disaster shocks impacts. G-2 (end hunger, achieve food security and

better nutrition and sustainable agriculture) is contained through the material fulfillment of basic human needs, growth and human development, procurement of food resources to increase human growth and development, food resources for obtaining good food for humans, as well as plant/animal breeding materials and their utilization. G-3 (ensures a healthy life and supports all people of all ages) is contained through the material on keeping pets (birds) in the environment so as not to cause disease, water hygiene problems, accidents that cause death, characteristics of future cooking. Childhood and puberty for boys and girls, protecting human life by breathing clean air without being contaminated with pollution or harmful chemicals. G-4 (ensure inclusive and quality education, equality also supports lifelong learning opportunities for all) is contained through the material to maintain unity and integrity in diversity and lifestyles that show Sustainability. G-5 (achieving gender equality and empowering all women and girls) is contained through the materials for the women's congress in Indonesia as a manifestation that women also get the same rights as men in carrying out their lives, providing public services that support the productivity of the leading community. G-6 (ensure the availability and management of clean water and sustainable sanitation for all) is contained through the availability, use, and management of clean water, the water cycle for life, and efforts to protect the water ecosystem from all pollution.

Aspects of Environmental Sustainability

The details of each aspect of EnS are spread out into four sustainable development goals, as presented in Table 6.

Table 6. Aspects of Environmental Sustainability

Goal	Indicator	%	Class and Theme
G-12	A 10-year framework related to consumption and production programs	4	3 (2,3); 4 (4,8); 5 (8); 6 (7)
	Sustainable management and efficient use of natural resources	37	1 (1,2,6,7,8); 3 (2,3,6,7); 4 (1,2,3,4,6,8,9); 5 (1.6); 6 (1,3,4,5,8)
	Reducing the amount of global food by half	1	3 (3); 5 (5)
	Achieve environmentally friendly management of chemicals and waste to minimize adverse effects on human health	6	2 (4); 3 (3,6); 4 (4); 5 (2,5); 6 (8)
	Substantially reduce waste production	4	2 (4), 4 (4); 5 (2,5); 6 (8)
	Support the procurement of sustainable public goods	4	3 (6), 4 (4)
	Ensuring that people get relevant information and awareness for development and lifestyles that support sustainability in harmony with nature	28	1 (6,7); 3 (1,4,5); 5 (1,2,3,4,5,6,9); 6 (2,4,6,8,9)
G-13	Strengthen the resilience and capacity of adaptation to dangerous things related to climate change and natural disasters	2	3 (5), 4 (9)
	Improve education, awareness, and also the capacity of both humans and institutions for climate change and early warning	9	3 (5), 4 (9)
G-14	Manage and protect marine and coastal ecosystems	2	3 (3); 4 (9); 5 (5)
	Minimizing the impact of increasing sea acidity	0.1	4 (9)
	Increasing the economic benefits of developing countries to marine resources	1	3 (7)
G-15	Ensure conservation, restoration, and sustainable use of terrestrial, water, terrestrial ecosystems and their services	0.1	4 (9)
	Support the implementation of sustainable management in all types of forests	0.1	2 (4)
	End the hunt for flora and fauna	0.1	2 (4)
	Integrate the value of ecosystems and biodiversity in national and local planning	5	3 (1); 4 (6), 5 (6,9); 6 (4,5,8)

Based on table 6, there are four SDGs goals stated in the textbook. The content that gets a large portion is the G-12 in the form of consumption responsibility: efficient use of natural resources (37%) and relevant information for development and a lifestyle that is in harmony with nature (28%). G-12 (ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns) is realized through the material process of making and using an object which is expected to continue to run without any detrimental aspects-specifications involved in it. Utilization of herbal medicine in making handicrafts as efficiently as possible, introducing and managing plastic waste in the environment, community mutual assistance efforts must ensure cleanliness, reducing plastic waste in the school environment, and managing alternative energy where it can generate benefits for humans. G-13 (taking immediate action to combat climate change and its impacts) is presented through the physical readiness of the community in dealing with climate change the introduction of things that need to be prepared in the event of a natural disaster. G-14 (conserve and sustainably use marine, oceanic and maritime resources for sustainable development) is presented through the management of marine, air, and salt material resources and fisheries to avoid increasing ocean acidity by introducing various water activities. G-15 (protecting, restoring, and supporting sustainable use of

terrestrial ecosystems, managing forests sustainably, combating desertification, and inhibiting and reversing land degradation and loss of biodiversity) is presented through an introduction to conservation efforts in the surrounding environment, introduction to a healthy environment, the introduction of flora and fauna, community activities in several areas in the context of making efforts for economic, social and environmental development.

Aspects of Economic Sustainability

The details of each ES aspect spread out into the four sustainable development goals are presented in table 7.

Table 7. Aspects of Economic Sustainability

Goal	Indicator	%	Class
G-8	Economic productivity activities and information technology quality improvement	32	4 (4,7,8); 5 (2,3,8,9); 6 (1,2,3,4,5)
	Encourage policies that support productive activities, job creation, and entrepreneurship	25	5 (2,3,4,8,9); 6 (1,2,3,4,5)
G-9	Build quality and reliable infrastructure that supports economic development and human well-being	2	5 (5,9), 6 (9)
	Improving the quality of infrastructure and adding components to the industry can be sustainable by efficient resources	1	6 (9)
G-10	Empower and encourage social, economic, and political inclusion for all regardless of the background of each community	12	6 (4,5)
G-11	Provision of safe and comfortable transportation for the community to use in their daily activities and economic activities	3	3 (7,8)
	Efforts to maintain world cultural heritage in moving the economy	20	3 (6), 4 (5,8); 5 (1,2,3,4,5,7,9); 6 (2,6,7,8,9)
	Providing universal access to public space	5	3 (7,8)

Based on table 7, there are four SDGs goals stated in the textbook. The G-8 are in the form of good jobs and economic growth: economic productivity activities, use of technology and encouragement of policies for productive activities and employment as well as efforts to maintain cultural heritage in driving the economy, containing the most significant portion (32%), respectively; (25%); (20%). The G-8 (supporting inclusive economic growth and sustainable development, full employment, and productive and decent work for all) appears in the material that mentions economic activities and jobs in the manufacturing process; Samarinda sarongs make superior products from the local area, which provide types of businesses and economic activities of the local community. The G-9 (building vital infrastructure, supporting inclusive and sustainable industrialization, and encouraging innovation) was conveyed through the material on community cooperation in making infrastructure that promotes economic activity, the positive and negative impacts of modernization—transportation technology, especially land transportation. The G-10 (reducing inequality within and between countries) is presented through materials to identify and develop economic diversity around them so that students know that their environment has different economic activities. G-11 (building inclusive, safe, resilient, and sustainable cities and settlements). This appears through the material on the Indonesian economy of transportation technology in the environment in the form of knowledge of transportation developments from ancient times to the present, which continues to grow and seems to be forgotten when used by the

community in mobilizing). These efforts promote the culture/crafts/dances of the archipelago that can attract the community's attention to encourage economic activities involved in these activities, public facilities (such as gas stations hospitals, which can be used by all people.

Sustainability Aspects of Inclusive Development

Details of each aspect of inclusive development spread into the four sustainable development goals are presented in table 8.

Table 8. Sustainability Aspects of Inclusive Development

Goal	Indicator	%	Class and theme
G-16	Ensuring responsive, inclusive, participatory, and representative decision making	12	3 (2,5,7,8); 5 (2,4)
	Ensuring public aspects of information and protecting fundamental freedoms	25	3 (7), 4 (4), 5 (7); 6 (2,3,5)
G-17	Implement effective capacity development regarding developing countries	3	6 (7)
	Increasing exports from developing countries	1	6 (5)
	Expanding global partnerships for sustainable development	25	6 (1,2,4,5,7)
	Support public partnerships that are built from experience and strategies in partnering	6	6 (1)
	Increasing support for developing the capacity of developing countries	27	6 (1,4,5,7,8)

Based on table 8, there are four SDGs goals stated in the textbook. The G-16 in the form of peace and justice in the form of protecting fundamental freedoms (25%) and the G-17 in the form of global partnerships in the form of cooperation for sustainable development (25%) and increasing support for developing the capacity of developing countries (27%) are material content that has a large portion the biggest. G-16 (supporting a peaceful and inclusive society for sustainable development, providing access to justice for all, and building effective, accountable, and inclusive institutions at all levels) is presented through decision-making implementation materials such as simulations of selecting class leaders or RT/RW in the neighborhood. Around, the freedom of students to obtain learning support information received from any reliable source. G-17 (strengthening implementation measures and revitalizing global partnerships for sustainable development) is presented through cooperation materials in this case related to Indonesia's role in politics in ASEAN, commodities that Indonesia exports to various ASEAN countries, the introduction of social and cultural life in ASEAN countries, and based on the suitability of their geographical location, as well as the economic relations of the two countries related to their geographical conditions.

Linkages between Aspects of Sustainable Development

Presentation of the contents of sustainable development aspects and the interrelationships between elements of curriculum theme textbooks in elementary schools are presented in table 9.

Table 9. Links between Aspects of Sustainable Development

No.	Linkages between aspects	%	Class and Theme
1	ES – EnS	2	4 (4,8); 5 (2,3,5,9); 6 (5)
2	ES – SS	6	4 (5,78,); 5 (3,4,5,9); 6 (2,3,4,5,6,7,9)
3	ES – SID	1	5 (2,8); 6 (1,4)
4	EnS – SS	12	1 (4,6,7,8); 2 (4); 3 (1,2,4,5,6,7); 4 (1,2,3,4,9); 5 (2,4,5,6, 8); 6 (1,4,6,8,9)
5	EnS – SID	0.1	3 (3)
6	SS - SID	4	5 (2,4,7); 6 (1,2,4,5,7,8)
7	ES - EnS – SS	1	3 (5); 5 (1.8); 6 (4,6)
8	ES - EnS – SID	0.1	6 (5)
9	ES - SS – SID	0.4	5 (9); 6 (2)
10	EnS - SS – SID	0.4	6 (4,8)
11	EnS - ES - SS - SID	0.1	6 (5)

Based on table 9, there are links between aspects of sustainable development contained in the textbook. First, the ES and EnS aspects are presented through the material of making cloth, which is used as a livelihood, which of course involves plants (cotton flowers), which are then used as a source of livelihood. Second, aspects of ES and SS through material efforts to protect the cultural heritage of the archipelago, which is also a form of appreciation for cultural diversity. Third, the ES and SID aspects are presented with material on economic activities carried out by the ASEAN community based on their geographical location. Fourth, parts of EnS and SS are offered through the physical readiness of the community in dealing with the impacts of climate change, especially in Indonesia, which needs to adapt to the tropical climate. Fifth, aspects of EnS and SID through deliberation materials conducted to determine the material to be used will make an alternative object of using environmentally friendly materials. Sixth, the integration of the SS and SID aspects is realized through each individual's material rights and obligations in carrying out deliberation.
Meanwhile, the linkages involving the three aspects of sustainable development have been stated in the textbook. First, the ES, EnS, SS aspects which are presented through the material of the triumph of the maritime ancestors of the Indonesian nation's ancestors in the form of the wooden Pinishi ship but can sail across the vast ocean, encouraging a sustainable lifestyle by reducing single-use plastic materials, reducing the use of wood efficiently so that preservation and beauty of the earth are maintained. Second, aspects of ES, EnS, SID are presented through Indonesia's material role in the economic field within ASEAN in terms of utilization of the diversity of natural resources. Third, aspects of ES, SS, SID, through business materials in preserving Indonesian batik, especially for the awarding of batik as Indonesian cultural heritage. Fourth, parts of EnS, SS, SID through the reading text material "Success Stories of Chili Farmers, With a Prosperous Future." The reading text introduces how to integrate ecosystem values and biodiversity as a poverty strategy by maintaining the genetic diversity of seeds in chili. Fifth, all aspects of EnS, ES, SS, and SID are delivered through reading materials "Batik Exports Continue to Increase" and "Kasongan Bantul, Pottery Exports Billions of Rupiahs Per Month." From the two reading texts, it is known that many Indonesian people's activities are labor-intensive to improve the economy through the use of natural resources.

Discussion

As stated in the SDGs, the initiation of the global community aims to realize a better human life through synergies between social, economic, and environmental aspects into the 5 Ps, namely people, planet, profit, peace, and partnership. These five basic principles then overshadow 17 unified goals and 169 goals. Based on the research results, thematic textbooks in elementary schools from grades 1 to grade 6 have contained 1,156 sustainable development materials spread into learning themes and sub-themes. Based on the analysis, it is known that narratives about consumption, lifestyle, efficient use of natural resources, consumption patterns, and sustainable production (G-12) are still dominantly presented. While pro-environment activities are limited to the aspects of introducing, reducing, and managing plastic waste, the use of energy that can generate benefits for humans is maintaining cleanliness.

The narrative of managing marine, oceanic and maritime natural resources is still a mainstay to support sustainable development. The presentation of textbook material often shows that the environment most often appears as God's creation, which students should be grateful for. Expression of gratitude to God, who has created a suitable environment for mankind, often only emphasizes the importance of exploiting the wealth of natural resources. Still, the responsibility for the destruction of nature is generally ignored. The themes presented in the 2013 Curriculum through textbooks are dominated by the presentation of creationism; instrumentalism and the way humans are presented as creatures separate from the environment, created as natural resources for human use; and the idea that God created Indonesia with rich natural resources for human use for prosperity. Horkheimer's analysis of instrumental rationalization in a capitalist society explains how the conquest of nature through scientific and technological progress has become the guiding ideology of modern society (Leiss, 1994). Projects to dominate nature in social evolution have caused ecological problems and increased social conflicts (Braune, 2013). This view is still very relevant to explain the current conditions in Indonesia related to the burden of the environmental crisis as a result of the practice of extractive industry activities. Based on critical theory, there are at least two 'big problems' regarding the environment from a sociological perspective, namely the role of rationality in human-nature relations and the commodification of the environment (Gunderson, 2015).

Material content that emphasizes the work aspect, economic growth in economic productivity, and technology occupies the most significant portion. The concept of sustainable development often leads to neglect of environmental Sustainability in favor of sustainable development. Borrowing the idea of Horkheimer, quoted by Held (1980), asserts that capitalism will only facilitate a huge expansion of production and greater control over nature, reducing individuals to the status only as functionaries of economic mechanisms' and imposing suffering on a large scale. One critical issue is that, as schools are part of a system that creates the world's environmental problems, we cannot expect them to provide an education that will criticize and change the environment. the larger structure of capitalism, inequalities, and injustices that result in environmental destruction. The presentation of textbook material on economic activities and manufacturing processes that utilize local natural resources, efforts to support industrialization activities, the positive and negative impacts of modernization, and the use of transportation technology still dominate. This shows how demographic shifts and economic development have a detrimental effect on the environment and how democratization and decentralization are not producing the expected benefits for the environment. In connection with the dominance thesis, another view is put forward by Schnaiberg

(2002) about the 'Treadmill of Production' (ToP), where the capitalist economy must continue to increase and expand production, create a production cycle ('treadmill') from natural resource extraction activities and create a surplus for production—reinvested in the production mechanism to further maximize profits. This is what according to Schnaiberg, the treadmill is the leading cause of environmental degradation.

The material content regarding the environmental crisis, both the causes and the perpetrators of the damage (who should be responsible), is not included in the presentation. Environmental awareness in Indonesia, especially about understanding and awareness of the dire ecological problems facing Indonesia and strategic prevention efforts, is still very lacking and limited (Parker et al., 2019). In the curriculum, a human agency to damage and limit environmental exploitation. Considering the scale of the environmental destruction in Indonesia, there is very little in the curriculum about responsibility for that destruction and the possibility of human conservation, recycling, consumption, or other ways to use this "resource" responsibly and sustainably. The lack of attention to explaining the causes of environmental degradation is a 'logic of appearance' rather than a 'logic of explanation' as well as a mystification of agency and responsibility (Fairclough, 2003) and an attempt to obscure the economic, political, and cultural causes of ecological destruction (Stibbe, 2004). Suppose humans are not identified as responsible for environmental destruction. In that case, we come to the complicated question of who is accountable, which can be a political-economic question about world power and conditions under late capitalism or a philosophical question about responsibility for evil in the world. On several occasions, when sensitive issues such as the negative impact of human actions on the environment are presented, they are presented from a distance as "authoritative expressions of fact" (Stibbe, 2004). There is a great distance and objectivity that explains as if there is no influence, no controversy, no agency, no conflict, no responsibility. This is what Apple calls the "valuative consensus," and such common values are part of the "hidden curriculum" of the Curriculum (Apple, 2004).

Meanwhile, regarding the presentation of the SDGs and ESD content into environmental, economic, social, and inclusive development aspects as well as the presentation of the learning dimensions (cognitive, affective, and action) based on the analysis, it is known that the material content is still dominated by economic interests such as trade cooperation, conservation of cultural heritage as ecotourism. And the use of natural resources as a livelihood. There have been presentations on community readiness to adapt to climate change. Still, they failed to explain the triggers and causes of the climate change crisis due to widespread land conversion, illegal logging, carbon emissions from extractive industries, etc. The instrumentalist narrative offers several insights into the technologies and eco-efficiency agendas that are believed to be able to increase environmental quality measures. At the same time, however, the instrumentalist approach cannot address many of the causes of social unsustainability. According to White (2004), this is due to a mistake in understanding technology in its entirety, where there is a separation of human goals from technological means.

There is material content regarding the role of rights and responsibilities in the deliberation. However, it still fails to explain how social conflicts are triggered by natural damage, which in this case are often marginalized and disadvantaged by local communities. The linkage of the EnS-SS-SID material presents the use of natural resources as a poverty alleviation strategy but fails to discuss conservation efforts and prevention of agricultural activities that damage environmental

conditions, such as replacing firmly rooted crops with commercial crops that are prone to landslides. Following the ongoing debate in environmental education studies, there are at least a number of needs. First, educational transformation to foster students' critical awareness, able to act to challenge unsustainable socio-ecological practices. Educators feel that supporting students to face and respond to ecological crises is extremely challenging tasks, tasks constrained by time constraints, their own emotional stress, professional expectations, about the climate across society and what guides work (Verlie et al., 2021). Therefore, addressing some of the problems facing environmental education in the future requires democratic strengthening and the unforeseen or unintended consequences of technological solutions and economic growth (Payne, 2020). As an alternative, it is relevant to adapt the activities of Ennis Thabong students in South Africa who have full support from parents to implement Self-Directed Education in eco-schools through investigating local water pollution problems (Kruger, 2020).

The linkage of the ES-EnS-SS material is found in materials that encourage sustainable lifestyle changes through efforts to reduce the use of plastic materials and use wood efficiently but are not accompanied by the impact of wasteful behavior. The concept of sustainable development known as the "triple P (People, Profit, Planet) shows that economic growth and industrial development, which are related to population growth and consumption as well as increasing demand for natural resources, is the root causes of environmental unsustainability (Washington, 2015). Without an in-depth and broad reading of development and Sustainability and their relationship to development impacts on local communities and ecological systems, such development actions would be unsustainable. They would run counter to the definition of development. All sustainable development issues are centered on inter-and intragenerational justice, which rests on the pillars of three different but interrelated dimensions, namely the environment, economy, and society (Mensah, 2019). The failure to acknowledge the contribution of mankind to such "natural disasters" encourages the reduction of isolationist thinking. This is one example of the silence surrounding human behavior related to environmental issues in Indonesian textbooks.

On the linkage of the material, ES-EnS-SID presents the role of natural resources as a commodity in increasing regional cooperation in the economic field. However, it fails to provide a balanced presentation of the impact of natural resource exploitation that can trigger an environmental crisis. One of the characteristics of modern society is the high consumption of industrial products derived from raw resource-based materials accompanied by the exploitation of natural resources (Wallace, 2019). Meanwhile, the linkage of the ES-SS-SID material presents the preservation of batik products as an Indonesian cultural heritage. Still, it fails to show the impact of the disposal of batik production waste which often pollutes the river. A criticism could be raised that years of schooling have not taught young people to think critically or constructively about their environment. Students often accept dubious knowledge to be presented as truth, and they do not know how to use science (natural and social) about "facts" to solve real problems around them. This condition certainly presents further challenges to the need for the development of critical education in environmental issues through eco-pedagogy at various levels of education, ranging from primary, secondary to tertiary education. Eco-pedagogy is an attempt to promote a critical understanding of human/nature relationships based on reactions to experiences (Zocher et al., 2020). Eco-pedagogy includes an ecological and educational worldview, developing into two major movements: philosophical eco-pedagogy, which focuses on metaphysical investigations of human-nature relations and related

problems in education, and critical eco-pedagogy, which emphasizes environmental justice; its mission is to criticize injustice and oppression involved in the issue. Environment (Hung, 2021). The presentation of SDGs and ESD content is still dominated by the emphasis on the cognitive learning dimension, while the focus on action efforts is still minimal. This is following what Parker et al. (2019) stated that there are at least four problematic aspects of pedagogy in Indonesia and many other developing countries, namely, learning practices are still dominated by continuous rote learning. Focusing on the transmission of facts, there is a gap between environmental awareness and knowledge on the one hand and pro-environmental behavior on the other and the effects of learned helplessness and apathy. Environmental Education (EE) is believed to be most effective when delivered as part of a whole school, a cross-curricular approach that exists in the environment, not only limited to textbook culture but needs to be supported by action-based environmental education and direct experience by facilitating students to ask questions about crisis conditions. on socio-ecological practices. Sustainability requires deep participation where youth become young adults who can participate as citizens who are critical, democratic, political, social justice, ecological, and change-oriented students as agents (Wals et al., 2009). If it is not discussed critically, it will tend to return to conventional thinking, relying only on scientific management and knowledge transfer. Socio-ecological transformation is related to the dynamics of the interaction of social and ecological systems in terms of vulnerability, resilience, and Sustainability (Brand et al., 2020).

There are many opportunities to include ecological themes in each subject competency content textbook, but the reality is very disappointing and almost does not happen. Although environmental themes have been included in some cases, they tend to be presented factually, for example, reporting environmental events such as landslides but not providing comments on what might have caused them. Environmental risk approaches and investigations in environmental education practices in schools are still marginalized (Hursh, 2015). The ESD plan that allows students to have the opportunity to be involved and participate in understanding critical problems, thinking about alternatives, making decisions, and solving problems collectively both locally and globally to create a quality of life today without destroying the planet earth seems entirely original to be questioned and doubted. Limited or missing explanations about the roots of the environmental crisis with socio-ecological dimensions in textbooks in schools will be earnest for sustainable education efforts. Ecological problems cannot be clearly understood, let alone solved, without strong attention to the handling of issues that occur in society (Davies, 2020). This is because most ecological problems arise from severe social problems. Humans are the leading cause of the environmental crisis, and humans as the solution to the environmental damage that occurs.

Conclusion

The presentation of material on economic growth and activities through the use of technology and the use of abundant natural resources as sustainable development commodities has a dominant portion, while presentations on environmental crises both about the root causes of crises, prevention efforts, and the responsibility of environmental crime actors are still missing from the presentation textbook content. Conservation efforts and pro-environmental activities are only reduced to the introduction, reduction, and management of plastic waste. The material is relevant as a learning experience initially but is inadequate when presented by ignoring the traces of the

ecological crisis at a later stage. Critical examination of the contents of textbooks on environmental crisis material in the education curriculum in schools is essential as the basis for efforts to raise vital awareness and efforts to save the environment by the younger generation in the future. Students at school are limited in the form of instrumental technical knowledge by doing something that already exists and has been found and seeking something that has not been discovered by critically investigating the practice of natural domination and the causes of the traces of the exploitative ecological crisis. Suppose this condition is allowed to continue and continues to occur. In that case, it is the same as allowing the practice of reproduction of stubborn and unsustainable ideologies in the curriculum and educational training in schools.

References

Apple, M (2004) Ideology and curriculum. Routledge.

Avelar, ABA, da Silva-Oliveira, KD, & da Silva Pereira, R (2019) Education for advancing the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals: A systematic approach. The International Journal of Management Education, 17 (3), 100322.

Berglund, T, Gericke, N, & Chang Rundgren, SN (2014) The implementation of education for sustainable development in Sweden: Investigating the sustainability consciousness among upper secondary students. Research in Science & Technological Education, 32 (3), 318-339.

Brand, U, Görg, C, & Wissen, M (2020) Overcoming neoliberal globalization: Social-ecological transformation from a Polanyian perspective and beyond. Globalizations, 17 (1), 161-176.

Braune, J (2013) Stephen Eric Bronner," Critical Theory: A Very Short Introduction.". Philosophy in Review, 33 (1), 16-19.

Davies, AR (2020) Environmentalism.

Fairclough, N (2003) Analysing discourse: Textual analysis for social research. Psychology Press.

Giroux, HA (2015) Dangerous thinking in the age of the new authoritarianism. Routledge.

Gunderson, R (2015) Environmental sociology and the Frankfurt School 1: Reason and capital. Environmental Sociology, 1 (3), 224-235.

Harring, N, Jagers, SC, & Matti, S (2017) Public support for pro-environmental policy measures: Examining the impact of personal values and ideology. Sustainability, 9 (5), 679.

Held, D (1980) Introduction to critical theory: Horkheimer to Habermas (Vol. 261). Univ of California Press.

Hung, R (2021) Ecopedagogy and Education. In Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Education.

Hursh, D, Henderson, J, & Greenwood, D (2015) Environmental education in a neoliberal climate. Environmental Education Research, 21 (3), 299-318.

Jickling, B (2005) Sustainable development in a globalizing world: A few cautions. Policy futures in Education, 3 (3), 251-259.

Kahn, RV & Kahn, R (2010) Critical pedagogy, ecoliteracy, & planetary crisis: The ecopedagogy movement (Vol. 359). Peter Lang.

Kopnina, H (2020) Education for the future? Critical evaluation of education for sustainable development goals. The Journal of Environmental Education, 51 (4), 280-291.

Kruger, J (2020) Self-directed education in two transformative pro-environmental initiatives within the eco-schools programme: A South African case study. Education as Change, 24 (1), 1-23.

Leigh, B (1991) Making the Indonesian state: The role of school texts. Review of Indonesian and Malaysian Affairs, 25 (1), 17-43.

Leiss, W (1994) Domination of nature. McGill-Queen's Press-MQUP.

Mensah, J (2019) Sustainable development: Meaning, history, principles, pillars, and implications for human action: Literature review. Cogent Social Sciences, 5 (1), 1653531.

Misiaszek, GW (2020) Countering post-truths through ecopedagogical literacies: Teaching to critically read 'development'and 'sustainable development'. Educational Philosophy and Theory, 52 (7), 747-758.

Parker, L & Prabawa-Sear, K (2019) Environmental Education in Indonesia: Creating Responsible Citizens in the Global South?. Routledge.

Payne, PG & Hart, P (2020) Environmental education, democracy, Thunberg, and XR. The Journal of Environmental Education, 51 (4), 263-269.

Schnaiberg, A, Pellow, DN, & Weinberg, A (2002) The treadmill of production and the environmental state. The environmental state under pressure, 10, 15-32.

Stibbe, A (2004) Environmental education across cultures: Beyond the discourse of shallow environmentalism. Language and Intercultural Communication, 4(4), 242-260.

Verlie, B, Clark, E, Jarrett, T, & Supriyono, E (2021) Educators' experiences and strategies for responding to ecological distress. Australian Journal of Environmental Education, 37(2), 132-146.

Wallace, HD (2019) Transdisciplinary learning in a kitchen garden: connecting to nature and constructing a path to ecoliteracy?. International Research in Geographical and Environmental Education, 28 (4), 309-323.

Wals, AE (2012) Shaping the education of tomorrow: 2012 full-length report on the UN decade of education for sustainable development. Unesco.

Wals, A & Jickling, B (2009) A framework for young people's participation in sustainability. Young people, education, and sustainable development: Exploring principles, perspectives, and praxis, 77-84.

Washington, H (2015) 17 Is 'sustainability'the same as 'sustainable development'?. Sustainability: Key issues, 359.

Westphal, MF, Franceschini, MC, & Setti, AFF (2018) How can the healthy municipalities, cities and communities strategy advance the Sustainable Development Goals agenda? Lessons from Agenda 21 and the MDGs in Brazil. In Lifelong learning and Education in Healthy and Sustainable cities (pp. 265-282). Springer, Cham.

White, R (Ed.) (2004) Controversies in environmental sociology. Cambridge University Press.

Zocher, JL & Hougham, RJ (2020) Implementing ecopedagogy as an experiential approach to decolonizing Science education. Journal of Experiential Education, 43(3), 232-247.