# Riding the Wave of Innovation: A Qualitative Analysis of Public Transport Drivers' Adaptation to Online-Based Transportation Services

# *Riding the Wave of Innovation*: Analisis Kualitatif Adaptasi Pengemudi Angkutan Umum Terhadap Pelayanan Transportasi Berbasis Online

### <u>Mochamad Kevin Romadhona<sup>1</sup></u>, Rachmat Dimas Oktafenanda<sup>2</sup>, Soekkyu Kim<sup>3</sup>, Noureldin Samy Elkhashab<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1,2</sup> Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Airlangga, Surabaya, Indonesia Address: Jalan Dharmawangsa Dalam Selatan, Surabaya, Jawa Timur, Indonesia, 60286
<sup>3</sup> College Martial Arts, Yong In University, Gyeonggi-do, South Korea
Address: 134, Yongindaehak-ro, Cheoin-gu, Yongin-si, Gyeonggi-do, South Korea 17092
<sup>4</sup> International Business, University of Cambridge, Cambridge, UK
Address: The Old Schools, Trinity Lane, Cambridge CB2 1TN United Kingdom Email: kevin.romadhona@staf.unair.ac.id

#### Abstract

Transportation Moda growing with various innovations created by people who see business opportunities. Online application-based transportation makes it easier for people to order vehicles to reach their destinations. Such as Go-jek with motorcycle taxi services for two-wheeled vehicles that will take passengers anywhere according to regional boundaries, go-food services or ordering food, and go-car to take passengers with four-wheeled vehicles or cars. This study uses qualitative research methods by looking at reality not only in one meaning. Qualitative research in general can be used for research on people's lives, history, behavior, organizational functionalization, social activities, and others. The result of this study is that the survival mechanism among public transport drivers is by way of debt and maximizing the income earned.

Keywords: public transportation; online transportation; survival mechanism

#### Abstrak

Moda Transportasi semakin berkembang dengan berbagai inovasi yang diciptakan oleh masyarakat yang melihat peluang bisnis. Transportasi berbasis aplikasi online memudahkan masyarakat dalam memesan kendaraan untuk mencapai tujuan. Seperti Go-jek dengan layanan ojek untuk kendaraan roda dua yang akan mengantar penumpang kemanapun sesuai batas wilayah, layanan go-food atau memesan makanan, dan go-car untuk mengantar penumpang dengan kendaraan roda empat atau mobil. Penelitian ini menggunakan metode penelitian kualitatif dengan melihat kenyataan tidak hanya dalam satu makna. Penelitian kualitatif secara umum dapat digunakan untuk penelitian mengenai kehidupan masyarakat, sejarah, perilaku, fungsionalisasi organisasi, aktivitas sosial, dan lain-lain. Hasil dari penelitian ini adalah mekanisme kelangsungan hidup di kalangan pengemudi angkutan umum adalah dengan cara berhutang dan memaksimalkan pendapatan yang diperoleh.

Kata kunci: transportasi umum; transportatis online; mekanisme survival

Biokultur, 2024, 13 (1): 16-25. DOI: <u>10.20473/bk.v13i1.54162</u> Article History: Received January 17, 2024; Accepted June 13, 2024; Published Online June 27, 2024



## Introduction

Public transportation is one of the transportations used by people by paying certain rates and used together (Junior, Rumajar, & Sendow, 2016). In this increasingly advanced era, many people want to have a private vehicle for reasons of comfort and conveniencetraveling (Karim et al., 2023). However, if we examine it again, if more and more people have private vehicles, various general problems will emerge, such as traffic jams (Ariesandi, Resita, & Salsabila, 2020), because private vehicle ownership continues to increase but road sections do not increase. So public transportation is one of the right solutions for dealing with traffic jams in big cities (Ginting & Ratnasari, 2022). The more people use public transportation, the more effective the use of the highway (Rivadi, 2022). One of the public vehicles known to the public is angkot or often called bemo (Agustin & Soehardjo, 2013). Angkot is a public transportation that has a predetermined route (Suarna, 2018). Angkot's can stop anywhere to pick up or drop off passengers according to a predetermined route. Unlike buses which have bus stops for stopping places, angkot are free to stop looking for passengers or dropping off passengers according to the passengers' destinations. Angkot's were introduced in Jakarta in the late 1970s under the name mikrolet (Fiansyah & Widyaningsih, 2023). Fares charged to passengers vary depending on how far or not the distance traveled to reach the passenger's destination. The operating route of an *angkot* can be identified by the color of the angkot and a sign or code with letters or numbers on the body of the angkot. In Indonesia, public transportation has its own nickname in various cities where this public transportation is available. For example, in Jakarta angkot are known as mikrolet (Fiansyah & Widyaningsih, 2023), in Surabaya angkot are called bemo or lyn (Yulaicho, 2022), in Medan it is called sudako (Ponirin, 2021), and so on.

In Surabaya, public transportation provides services to the public to go to the corners of the city of Surabaya according to the passengers' destinations. In Surabaya itself, there are several public transportation terminals and also city buses, such as the pond terminalosowilangun, joyoboyo terminals, bratang terminals and others. Several *angkot*, known as Lyn in Surabaya, are divided into several groups with various routes determined by the transportation agency. The bus fare ranges from Rp. 6000,- one way. Usually *angkot* wait for passengers in strategic places or wait for passengers at the terminal. The number of microbuses or public transportation in Surabaya is 5,173 units with a capacity of 62,076 seats (Aminah, 2018), which are divided into 59 main routes. The number of taxis in Surabaya that receivepermission Mayoral Licensing Letters (SPW) for 5,835 units, but only 5,130 units were realized, of that number, only 4,270 units are currently operating (Aminah, 2018).

As it developed, transportation is also growing with various innovations created by people who see business opportunities. Transportation in this City of Heroes is no exception. With advances in communication technology, it is now also being used as a tool to make it easier for someone to access transportation. Online application-based transportation makes it easier for people to order vehicles to reach their destinations (Damayanti, 2017). Such as Go-jek with motorcycle taxi services for two-wheeled vehicles that will take passengers anywhere according to regional boundaries, go-food services that make it easier for someone to order food and have it delivered to the place of the person who ordered it, go-car to take passengers with wheeled vehicles four or a car (Agustin & Khuzaini, 2017). Then other online transportation emerged such as Uber, Grab, and so on. In addition to making it easier for passengers to get transportation services, the costs

incurred are quite cheap. So that many people from various groups take advantage of online transportation as a means of transportation place objective.

With the existence of online transportation, *angkot* as conventional vehicles are now starting to rarely be in demand (Amir & Rahman, 2020). Even though every time it operates, there are still people who use conventional transportation services such as public transportation. The reduced number of passengers due to switching to online transportation has made public transportation drivers increasingly anxious and worried. Because public transportation drivers realize that people are starting to like online transportation and public transportation passengers are starting to decrease while the deposits don't decrease, gasoline is getting more expensive, and the cost of necessities of life varies and continues to increase. Although still operating as usualworries even the bus drivers cannot avoid it. then the *angkot* drivers protested against the government. *Angkot* drivers protested that online transportation in Surabaya was limited and had to do a test drive (Nugroho, 2017). *Angkot* drivers request that the government issue rules for online transportation such as online transportation (eg driver's test obligations, drivers' obligations, legal entity obligations), requesting that online transportation be limited in number, so as not to erode the existence of conventional transportation such as public transportation (Abdullah, 2019).

With the rise of online transportation, public transportation drivers are worried that the existence of online transportation can erode and even kill the existence of public transportation. the number of public transportation in Surabaya is now around 5,500 units while the number of online transportation has reached 17,000 units (Ginanjar, 2022). The number of public transportation is not comparable to the number of online transportation. The income of *angkot* drivers has dropped dramatically after the presence of online transportation (Ginanjar, 2022). Based on the explanation above, it can be seen that there are problems that arise after the presence of online transportation where public transportation feels that their existence is being shut down and is threatened with being displaced by online transportation. So in this study the researchers wanted to see how *angkot* drivers survivehis livelihood as a city transportation driver in Surabaya after online transportation.

### **Research Methods**

This research uses qualitative research methods by looking at reality not only in one meaning (Anggito & Setiawan, 2018). Qualitative research in general can be used for research on people's lives, history, behavior, organizational functionalization, social activities, and others. One of the reasons for using a qualitative approach is the experience of researchers where this method can be used to discover and understand what is hidden behind phenomena (Bungin, 2001). Qualitative is a research method that can explain a phenomenon coherently, because in extracting data the researcher is not only someone who seeks information but also a tool used in research, in this study sees a reality with a paradigm constructivism which explains that the reality that occurs is the result of the construction of society itself, constructivism itself is a continuation of phenomenological theory (Subadi, 2006). The constructivism paradigm is a paradigm that is almost an understanding that places observation and objectivity in discovering a reality of knowledge (Pardede, 2009).

This paradigm views social science through direct and detailed observation of the social actors involved in creating and maintaining or managing their social world. Constructivism sees the cause of its breakdown driver *angkot* because there is no system or rules or agreement between *angkot* 

drivers and online transportation. Especially in terms of online transportation permits, they don't have permits but instead do supported by the government. Like public transportation, every 6 months public transport pays KIR and pays taxes while other online transportation is unofficial and does not pay taxes or KIR drivers. And online transportation makes it easy to find passengers using the application, with online transportation it has an impact on income. The *angkot* driver who decreased to the *angkot* driver.

According to Max Weber, the constructivism paradigm that assesses human behavior is fundamentally different from natural behavior, because humans act as agents who construct their social reality, both through giving meaning and understanding behavior (Wirawan, 2012). According to Weber, explains that substance The form of life in society is not only seen from an objective assessment, but seen from actions individual Which arises from subjective reasons. Weber also saw that each individual will influence society

### **Results and Discussion**

Discussion of the research that has been carried out by researchers is regarding the existence and survival mechanisms of public transportation drivers in the midst of the current rise of online transportation. In this study the researchers divided the research focus into several focus discussions as follows

#### The Survival of Public Transportation Drivers in the Midst of Online Transportation in Surabaya

A beginning is a stage that must be passed in all processes of life. Beginning is the first stage that determines the next stage that will occur and be passed further in life. Likewise in this study, before entering into the main discussion, the researcher will first discuss the informants' beginning to become a public transportation driver or what motivated the informant to choose a job as an *angkot* driver, especially in the city of Surabaya which is one of the big cities in Indonesia and already has lots of variety of jobs. Furthermore, the results of research through in-depth interviews conducted by researchers obtained the following data.

The data obtained in in-depth interviews explained that each informant hadbackground differ regarding the initial informant who became an *angkot* driver. Starting from the informants themselves who were interested in the public transportation's income, which was quite a lot at that time, so the informants chose to become an *angkot* driver. From other jobs include being a state official, as follows:

"At first the bus drivers used to be crowded, there weren't that many cars, the passengers were crowded so I used to like public transportation instead ofpewagai country. In the past, the salary was only a little bit, before what the entrepreneur needed, like drivers, used to be a lot of people. ..." (Mr. M. Syafi'i)

The above is the result of an interview with Mr. M. Syafi'i, the bus driver*lyn G* who is a graduate of STM and had worked in a building then decided to change jobs to become an *angkot* driver. The informant chose to become an *angkot* driver because the income of an *angkot* driver at that time was quite high, even higher when compared toofficer country at that time. This statement was also supported by the statements of other informants as follows:

"it used to be deposit every month the contract is 800 thousand. First it was in 86 maybe, 86 & 87 the bemo driver still earns a lot, still enough, still good. Then every day at that time the net income was 200 thousand 150 thousand, so the net income was already deducted from the gasAlready the deposit is deducted, after that I can buy a house and can send my children to school, I have two children, yes in 86, 87, 88until In the 90's, the income was still big,after.. in 98 maybe, yes in 98 it was easy to get motorcycle loans, right because of that" (fatherSadjoeto)

The statement above is a statement from MrSadjoeto which issomeone an STM graduate majoring in engineering from Madiun who wanted to work in Kalimantan, but discouraged him because he did not get permission from his older brother at the time who happened to live in Surabaya. So that in the end fatherSadjoeto decided to look for work in Surabaya. After several years of changing jobs, finally MrSadjoeto become a bus driver by capitalizing on his younger brother's *angkot* and paying rent to his younger brother.

The statement of Sadjoeto on provide information for researchers regarding the revenue of public transportation which is quite large in 1986 to 20101990 an namely, with a net income of Rp. 150,000 to Rp. 200,000 per day, which made several informants interested to become a bus driver at that time. However, several informants stated that being an *angkot* driver was the only thing they could do to earn money because of their limited ability and education.

"Initially, I went to school like Ms. So I went to school while working on the internet first. Yes, my factor cannot continue from my parents. In the end, it's been working like this before, it's still crowded, it's delicious"

"Yes, I used to be a kernet, first, I didn't have an education, I didn't go to school, it didn't matter how I could eat, that's how it was"

Above are statements from informants named Mr. Sucipto and Mr. Sholeh who provided information to the researchers that the informants were not only tempted by the public transportation's income but also because of their limitations in education.

Furthermore, the researcher wanted to know the opinion of the informants regarding transportation currently booming online.

"Well, if it's for bemo drivers, it will reduce income. Those who used to ride bemo continue to ride motorbikes, yes gojekplot yes, continue to take Uber, continue to ride especially that, take Grab, that's it. So, for example, 4 people or 3 people taking Uber is more economical. If from Joyoboyo to Rungkut, if you take Uber, sometimes it's 20,000 or 25,000, yes.to.."(then Sadjoeto)

"Yes, the income is low, ya kayakgojek, Uber, what else, there are many others, right? It's not official, right? Blame it on the government, Ms(*Mr. Sholeh*)

"Excuse me, sir, if you could tell me how much he earns per day? No Canmake sure sis, I think you can choose which one sometimes you get, sometimes you don't. Yes, how many do you

get, sir? If you get it, sometimes it's at least 20, sometimes 25 a day, the problem isnot can be many times only 1 time nownot like before, now it only goes around once, there are lots of online bus services. So now the number of passengers is reduced, before it could still be 2, 3, 4. Now only 1 time. In the past, I could earn more than 100, sis. Like this, sis, if there's a problem with online taxis, if you're like this, I'm now asking Miss. Do not return it to Ms. I think you are a student. I think if something like this is not official, it's not official, right, I think the government doesn't know about it or yes, yeslike in ignorance it's like stealth. Yah to Where are we now, while we, Len, have always followed the rules we were told to dodone ok KIR. That's a repair KIR, you pay for the route, you know, that KIR. Routenaah keep on KIRpermission route, in touch we will test, KIR we will test while online or not? Well, there isn't any, naaah stealth. If we say stealth is the same as genderuwo, the name for stealth is that the drivers used to say it's the same as the devil, wong don't have permission to do anythingsilenced just. It's even supported by the government. This is what I regret, sis, that the current government is not like the previous government. If the former government paid attention to the little people. Yes, if they really needed to be formalized, that's okay. Says the 1styesterday it was inaugurated until now where it hasn't been inaugurated yet there is no yellow plate. I think if it's on a yellow plate, the person won't be stupid, miss, don't want it, miss. Yes, I do it once every 6 monthsthink so, the samethe tax government. ifspider it hits 64 every year it hits 48 I think it's not yetspider That's a different STNK, that's the same as no government income but I have a bus permit. (Mr. Sucipto)

The statement above is an informant's opinion regarding online transportation which is currently booming. In this case, all informants said the same thing, namely that online transportation had the same impact for them, namely decreased income due to a decrease in the number of passengers. Informants also felt that online transportation was left unattended by the government without any collection of operating fees such as taxes imposed on other public transportation including public transportation. They think that the government should be responsible for this.

Transitions in Livelihood: A Retrospective Analysis of Bemo Drivers' Economic Shifts Over Time In the following, the researcher will describe the life of the informants before and after online transportation based on the statements of the informants through in-depth interviews.

"At that time, when the minibus was still easy, it was the time for the motorcycle Not yet Lotsplot, well motorcycleNot yet a lot, the income of a bemo driver is still a lot. I can buy a house, I can buy a bemo, I can send all my 2 children to S1, yes, one S1 at UPN majoring in Industrial Chemistry, the other at Ubaya majoring in Pharmacy. yes, before the year 90's, now it's like this, this is what I'm left with to feed my own life, the problem is that the children are already working, already have a family, everyone has their own dependents, I don't ask for children like that, you know. my wifeAlready died, so I'm left alone, if for myself, it can be enough, but if you have a wife and have 1, 2 children, that's heavy, wes not far enough, right there" (Mr.Sadjoeto).

From your statementSadjoeto above the researcher got information that the income of public transportation was quite high in 1986, 1987, 1988 to 1990 and began to decline in 1998.

"So now the number of passengers is reduced, before it could still be 2, 3, 4revolution Can. Now only 1 time. Like this, sis, sometimes we don't have enough debt, so like this, we don't deposit every day for 1 month, for example, we don't get any money. The money for shopping is usdebt the deposit money. When you deposit for 1 month, for example, it is not enough, you are looking for a loan, moneylenders, sis." (Mr. Sucipto)

The above is a statement from Mr. Sucipto who provided information to researchers that the life of a bus that used to be full of passengers circled the route 4 times, but now it only goes around 1 time.

"Before online motorcycle taxis were pretty good. I still bring home 80,000, if it's crowded, you can get a charter, it can be up to 100,000. Yes enough. Bares now wow wes debts now with friends. Replace like that. I throw 30,000 every now and then if I can, if it's interesting. If not interesting? This is already not interesting. This service has been done. Even though I already queued from 7pm last night. Wow, the income has decreased. This is drastic. Yes, 30,000 sometimes 25,000, 20,000. Ha ha. Insufficientuntil I can't pay school. The school children are SMA 6 Surabaya. That Margorejo, that SMK. Grade 1. So yesterday you had a repeat exam and you couldn't pay and asked to join the school principal and happened to be accompanied by the deputy principal. That's what I asked to make a statement. That's my strength,pay it that's 100,000 per month. Orderask for certificate from the municipality. I already love the school there already. Sometimes the realization is July, right? Mangkane if you can't afford to pay. In the past, there was no online, online taxi, yes, we were quite sufficient. Because that's the way it is. Now that's hard. All. If the same no believe me, you respond to those drivers. It's hard now." (father M. Syafi'i)

From Mr. M. Syafi'i's statement above, the researcher can conclude that the life of *angkot* and *angkot* drivers has really changed since the existence of online transportation. Which is evidenced by the decline in passengers and incomedriver *angkot* so they have to owe their friends and many administrative costs such as children's school fees that cannot be resolved.

The informant did not switch to other livelihoods, including online transportation itself, if it is considered that online transportation is more profitable.

"Yes, how about it, deck? At this age, it's hard to find another job." (Mr Sucardi) I think if so what is applying for problems with other drivers, it's the same. If you're a bus, yes, that's it. Personally, I haveapply personal but agenot fulfil. I was accepted, but "oh man, he's already 67, sir. Parents are sick, sir." Loh mas I'm healthy how come I. "Yes sir. Your father is usually 67Already sickly". Yesthank you if I don't get accepted That's it." (Mr. M. Syafi'i)

The data from the in-depth interviews above illustrate that almost all informants or public transportation drivers are constrained by the age of more than 40 years where it is difficult to get another better job at that age.

Regulatory Oversight and Public Transportation: An Analysis of Governmental Attention to Online Taxi Services vis-à-vis Traditional Public Transport

"The demo was about that uber thing. The online taxi. The goal is that online is removed. Deleted so that the angkot can live. Well, if the driver is online, right? KIR yes

no, the route doesn't exist. Smuggled he said. It's official. Routes exist, Route Permits exist. It's all complete. La KIR is also there. Lawhat's up Why doesn't the government pay attention to this len-len driver? That's it. The bus driver. How come Uber doesn't even have that license?contraband like going for a walk, it's like an online motorcycle taxi, it's not KIR, isn't itpack permission. Only local permits. That location. This is official permission. When I started to become a driver starting in 1963 until now, yes. But the government doesn't pay attention to that. If you have a demonstration, you will think that the bus driver is so and so. Like yesterday, what was a demonstration at Graha, on the 21st, if I'm not mistaken, that's right. Even met Pak Karwo. Evening promised noon. Maybe scared. If the angkots want to demonstrate, it's all in Surabaya, it's jammed. Finally, Pak Karwo promised to straighten it out. But the reality is not there yet. There's no news. Like uber online, anu taxi online. There is no news now. This might be the people, maybe the children will want it soon, maybe after Eid is over. Well, that's it. It's already in the anufriend-friend already deliberation. This is fasting day, we respect fasting day. Yes, let's be patient. Yes, what are you waiting for after this holiday. Usually on this holiday, a lot of people go back to their villages, on charters. The people who help the household are a group. Now no. Now Uber is here too. Yes, just call Uber and it's here. That's it. What are we going to do? Nothing. Nothing is expected for this holiday. Yes, the term is JavaneseNo fried coffee. Ha ha hamejones not cool haha That's right." (father M. Syafi'i)

From the statements of the informants, the researcher draws the conclusion that the efforts made by these informants or *angkot* drivers are demanding the government to make decisions and policies that are mutually beneficial to all parties, and they are only patient waiting for the government to comply with these demands.

Survival Strategies of Public Transportation Drivers in the Face of Intense Competition: A Sociological Exploration Based on Scott's Theory

Based on Scott's theory, *angkot* drivers do the same thing in order to survive in the midst of intense competition in the world of transportation. When my farmers carry out a survival strategy by reducing spending on food by eating only once a day and switching to low quality food. But the *angkot* driver chooses to survive by continuing to do what he usually does as an *angkot* driver. For example, if they only get 20,000 with 1 *angkot* car, they try to run another *angkot* (owned by a friend) to get them pull the bus. So they get extra money even though their income is divided in half. They still survive even though their lives and jobs are threatened with death because the passengers are getting quieter. *Angkot* drivers try to keep the price policy the same, not increasing it even though they have few passengers. Because according to them, the fares offered are already cheap, they are still inferior to online transportation which is a trend in the city, especially when the budget is high, the fate of the driver and the *angkot* is in danger of extinction from the streets.

Another effort made by *angkot* drivers to survive is by borrowing or borrowing money. When public transportation drivers try to maximize their income, which is indeed lacking and insufficient for daily needs, they are forced to owe good debts to friends who are also work colleagues or relatives. Informants admitted that they were forced to owe if the income they received could not cover what was lacking in their lives. They even admit that if they don't get debt from friends or relatives, they are willing to not eat and can'tfinance their child goes to school and tries to make a statement from the kelurahan addressed to the school regarding the purpose of not being able to pay off his child's school administration fees. It is this relationship that Scott means, namely the

term patron-client in the socio-economic world which is not implemented, because as an *angkot* driver you do not know the term*cash voucher*or owe as agricultural laborers do to the owners of capital in general.

This matter allowed by our five informants interview, that with an income that is no more than the salary of a civil servant and does not have the right to the regional UMR salary and actually they are public transportation drivers it is still not enough to meet the needs of daily life in terms of the household or the child's schooling. The five informants also said that their lives were actually below average or lack of necessities and in the end they had to give up not eating in order to bring money to cook at home. "Life has been difficult since the beginning but still Can a little to meet the needs, but must survive even more in the competition that must be faced mentally and physically". How could they not, in terms of age and experience they are definitely different, so they can only surrender and continue to live life as usual.

## Conclusion

The conclusion of this research according to data, there are many reasons behind the existence of the survival of conventional public transportation drivers not to change their livelihoods in the midst of the bustle of transport on line. The development of information technology, communication and transportation is increasingly advanced. This is what makes competition between one another, namely starting from conventional transportation to transportations using online media. *Angkot* drivers using the survival mechanism developed by conventional transport drivers in the Joyoboyo Terminal area, Surabaya are quite diverse. How do public transportation developments, such as online transportation? With various ways to survive, for example by owing money to friends, saving and maintaining their existence as cheap conventional transportation, public transportation existed. Like as we know that, there have been many attempts as expressed by Scott about the survival mechanism. However, what happened to the *angkot* driver was not what the patron and client did, but rather how they can still survive with changing and developing conditions so that they can still maintain their existence as public transportation drivers.

## References

- Abdullah A (2019) Dampak hadirnya jasa angkutan Online bagi pendapatan sopir angkutan kota di Kota Palangka Raya. IAIN Palangka Raya.
- Agustin A & Khuzaini K (2017) Persepsi Masyarakat Terhadap Penggunaan Transportasi Online (Go-Jek) Di Surabaya. *Jurnal Ilmu Dan Riset Manajemen (JIRM)*, 6(9).
- Agustin BI & Soehardjo, AJ (2013) Perancangan Visualisasi Rute Angkutan Umum Darat Kota Surabaya. *Jurnal DKV Adiwarna*, 1(2): 5.
- Aminah S (2018) Transportasi publik dan aksesibilitas masyarakat perkotaan. *Jurnal Teknik Sipil*, 9(1): 1142–1155.
- Amir M & Rahman A (2020) Analisis Dampak Transportasi Online Terhadap Transportasi Konvensional (Bentor) Di Kota Makassar. *Jurnal Mirai Management*, 5(1): 313–329.

- Anggito A & Setiawan J (2018) Metodologi penelitian kualitatif. CV Jejak (Jejak Publisher).
- Ariesandi JA, Resita R & Salsabila Z (2020) Kebijakan Transportasi Umum (Angkot) Untuk Menanggulangi Kemacetan Jalan. *Jurnal Kebijakan Publik*, 11(2): 77–82.
- Bungin B (2001) *Metodologi Penelitian Sosial, Format-Format Kauntitatif dan Kualitatif.* Surabaya: Airlangga University Press.
- Damayanti SAS (2017) Transportasi Berbasis Aplikasi Online: Go-Jek Sebagai Sarana Transportasi Masyarakat Kota Surabaya. Surabaya: Universitas Airlangga.
- Fiansyah FS & Widyaningsih N (2023) Analisis Kinerja dan Kepuasan Pelayanan terhadap Moda Transportasi Kwk B 08 (Grogol Petamburan–Rawa Buaya). Jurnal Sosial Dan Sains, 3(2): 108–113.
- Ginanjar D (2022) Jumlah Angkot di Surabaya Kian Sedikit: Dulu Jaya, Kini Merana. Retrieved July 10, 2023, from Jawa Pos website: https://www.jawapos.com/surabaya-raya/01242085/jumlah-angkot-di-surabaya-kian-sedikit-dulu-jaya-kini-merana
- Ginting NM & Ratnasari NE (2022) Study Literature Review Artikel Terindeks Scopus Perihal Kebijakan Berkelanjutan Untuk Mengatasi Kemacetan Lalu Lintas. *Aliansi: Jurnal Politik, Keamanan Dan Hubungan Internasional*, 175–181.
- Junior NPS, Rumajar ALE & Sendow TK (2016) Analisis Kebutuhan Angkutan Umum Penumpang Kota Manado (Studi Kasus: Paal Dua –Politeknik). *Jurnal Sipil Statik*, 4(6).
- Karim AH, Lesmini L, Sunarta DA, Suparman A, Yunus AI, Khasanah, Marlita D, Saksono H, Asniar N, Andari T (2023) *Manajemen Transportasi*. Cendikia Mulia Mandiri.
- Nugroho BS (2017) Implementasi permenhub nomor 32 tahun 2016 terhadap pengaturan transportasi online di Kota Malang: Studi di Kantor Dinas Perhubungan Kota Malang. Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim.
- Pardede P (2009) Paradigma Penelitian. Universitas Kristen Indonesia.
- Ponirin P (2021) Sudako: Angkutan Kota Sebagai Moda Transportasi Masyarakat Kota Medan Pada 1970-1998. *Puteri Hijau: Jurnal Pendidikan Sejarah*, 6(2): 66–75.
- Riyadi S (2022) Peran Dinas Perhubungan Provinsi Dki Jakarta Dalam Penertiban Angkutan Umum Berdasarkan Undang-Undang Nomor 22 Tahun 2009 Tentang Lalu Lintas Dan Angkutan Jalan. *Mustika Justice: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum*, 2(2).
- Suarna N (2018) Sistem Informasi Geografis Rute Angkutan Umum Melalui Penerapan Google Map Api (Studi Kasus: Kota Cirebon). *Internal (Information System Journal)*, 1(2), 1–10.
- Subadi T (2006) Metode penelitian kualitatif. Muhammadiyah University Press.
- Wirawan DI (2012) Teori-teori Sosial dalam Tiga Paradigma: fakta sosial, definisi sosial, dan perilaku sosial. Kencana.
- Yulaicho MR (2022) Peran Dinas Perhubungan Dalam Mengoptimalisasikan Fungsi Pengelolaan Trayek Angkutan Kota Lyn Di Terminal Intermoda Joyoboyo Kota Surabaya. UPN Veteran Jawa Timur.