SUCCESS FACTORS OF MENTORING AND SUPERVISION BY HOSPITAL SUPERVISORY AGENCY

Faktor Keberhasilan Pembinaan dan Pengawasan oleh Badan Pengawas Rumah Sakit

Dea Devita¹, Septo Pawelas Arso², Nurhasmadiar Nandini³
¹,²,³Faculty of Public Health, Diponegoro University, Indonesia
*Correspondence: nurhasmadiar.nandini@live.undip.ac.id

ABSTRACT

Background: A Hospital Supervisory Agency was established to assist hospitals to maintain their service quality. However, not all provinces have an effective Hospital Supervisory Agency. One of the Hospital Supervisory Agency that have run properly is Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency.

Aim: This study analyzed the success factors of Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency in implementing supervision and mentoring to hospitals in Yogyakarta according to the Indonesian Government Regulation Number 49 of 2013.

Methods: This study employed a descriptive-qualitative approach and was conducted in Yogyakarta from January to June 2019. Data were collected with in-depth interview to informants chosen by purposeful sampling technique.

Results: Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency could construct a mindset that hospitals will get benefits when partnering with them. Also, the members of Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency had strong commitment and work ethic to create innovative strategies and networking to many related stakeholders in spite of low funds from Yogyakarta Provincial Health Office or Yogyakarta Government.

Conclusion: The success factors of Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency is determined by the high commitment of the members and well-built cooperation between Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency and all hospitals in Yogyakarta.

Keywords: Hospital Supervisory Board, success factors, mentoring, supervision.

ABSTRAK


Hasil: BPRSP DIY berhasil membangun mindset bahwa rumah sakit akan mendapatkan manfaat ketika bekerjasama dengan BPRSP. Selain itu, anggota BPRSP menunjukkan komitmen dan etos kerja yang kuat sehingga dapat menciptakan inovasi strategis dan membangun jaringan dengan berbagai stakeholder terkait tanpa dukungan pendanaan yang cukup dari Dinas Kesehatan DI Yogyakarta maupun pemerintah DI Yogyakarta.

Kesimpulan: Keberhasilan BPRSP DIY didukung tingginya komitmen para anggotanya dan kerjasama yang tersusun dengan baik antara BPRS dan seluruh rumah sakit di Yogyakarta.

Kata kunci: Badan Pengawas Rumah Sakit, faktor keberhasilan, pembinaan, pengawasan.
 Supervisory Agency (Badan Pengawas Rumah Sakit/BPRS).

Even though Hospital Supervisory Agency has an important role to assist hospitals, not all provinces have a Hospital Supervisory Agency. One of the provinces which has a Hospital Supervisory Agency is Yogyakarta. Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency provides external mentoring and monitoring for hospitals. The Decree of Yogyakarta Provincial Governor’s Number 230/KEP/2015 legitimates the roles of Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency. However, Chasanah (2016) and Alawiya and Utami (2018) found that Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency was not ready in fulfilling their responsibilities. There were several problems identified, especially cases related to dispute resolution at hospitals, such as lack of technical procedures, hospitals’ low acceptability, lack of resources and fund for operational activities (Chasanah, 2016; Alawiya and Utami, 2018).

Hospital Supervisory Agency encourages hospitals to improve the quality of services even though not all Hospital Supervisory Agency could have carried out their roles. Based on the previous studies conducted by Chasanah (2016) and Alawiya and Utami (2018), further studies need to evaluate the performance of Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency in 2019 to identify the improvements. The present study looked at different discussions that the previous studies have not covered, especially related to mentoring and supervision on dispute resolution at hospitals. The preliminary study showed that Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency successfully assisted several hospitals in Yogyakarta in 2019. Because of these considerations, this study discussed how Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency successfully carried out mentoring and supervision to hospitals in Yogyakarta Province in terms of human resource, coordination between the Hospital Supervisory Agency and the hospitals, and how Yogyakarta Province formulated policies of supervision to hospitals, thus established Hospital Supervisory Agency.

METHOD

This study used a qualitative method with a descriptive approach. It collected data with in-depth interview to informants, including Head of Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency as a main informant who carried out the mentoring and supervision and Yogyakarta Provincial Health Office as well as District Public Hospital as triangulation informants.

The Head of General Affair and Finance Unit from Panembahan Senopati Bantul Hospital was chosen as a representative of a state hospital. Meanwhile, the Head of Medical Service Unit from Nur Hidayah Hospital was chosen as a representative of non-state hospital. As the other triangulation informant was Yogyakarta Provincial Health Office, the Head of Referral Service Unit was delegated.

Choosing the state hospital and private hospital as the triangulation informants represented perspectives of all hospitals in Yogyakarta Province. Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency is an external organization which has to work with the same ways of mentoring and supervision both at state and private hospitals. The informants chosen from both hospitals were to enrich findings from two points of view. The research variables were regulations and initiation, input, process and the implementation of the supervision and mentoring conducted by Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Public policy is a guide to action and policy implementation which involves interpreting the goals and objectives of a policy into an action (Khan, 2016). This study analyzed the implementation of policy about how Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency runs in Yogyakarta. The implementation of policy requires clarification of goals, missions and objectives, detailed planning, appropriate job assignments, effective monitoring and evaluation, comprehensive and efficient operating procedures and techniques. These aspects assist implementers to define the scope of their responsibilities according to the policy objectives to achieve goals (Khan and Khandaker, 2016). Initiation to establish Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency is one of policies implemented, thus hospitals must understand how to implement the policy effectively.

“There were a lot of conflicts between hospital and community. So, we need an external organization to solve the problems and become a mediator. Therefore, Yogyakarta Provincial Health Office initiated to build Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency.” (Main Informant)

“When Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency visited our hospital, we could understand our strength and shortcomings.” (Triangulation Informant 2)

Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency aims to solve problems between community and hospital and assist them to assess and evaluate their performance. External evaluators are mostly more neutral because they have no relationship with the Hospitals than internal evaluator. Araújo et al. (2019) mentioned internal evaluators usually provide more favorable results than external evaluator. There were several evaluation models designed to evaluate hospital performance. Those models, however, might be implemented differently in each hospital based on various characteristics of the hospitals (Bahadori et al., 2016).

The difficulties in determining hospital evaluation models occur due to the lack of systemic
views by experts, lack of attention on some stages of the evaluation process due to personal preferences, lack of manpower, and else (Bahadori et al., 2016). These causes could be prevented by establishing an external evaluator team, such as BPRS.

Results showed there were regulations which Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency referred to carry on mentoring and supervision. There were central regulations, such as Law No. 44 of 2009 about Hospital, Government Regulation No. 49 of 2013 on Hospital Supervisory Board, Regulation of Indonesian Ministry of Health No. 17 of 2014 on Membership, Assignment, and Discontinuance of Indonesia Hospital Supervisory Board Members, Regulation of Indonesian Ministry of Health No. 88 of 2015 on Guidelines for Supervision, Reporting System, and Information System for Mentoring and Supervision implemented by Hospital Supervisory Board, and other regulations related to hospital mentoring and supervision function. The problem is the unavailability of strong regulation in a regional level of Yogyakarta Province, while the available regional regulation is merely a Governor Decree Number 175/KEP/2018. However, the Governor Regulation has not been available yet.

Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency was initially established by Yogyakarta Provincial Health Office in a short period. The main informant and triangulation informants stated that Yogyakarta Provincial Yogyakarta Hospital Supervisory Agency was established in 2015 before the central government’s regulation was not officially published. The short establishment of the Hospital Supervisory Agency was made because the Hospitals actively looked for information about hospital mentoring and supervision. Therefore, once they identified the functions of mentoring and supervision, they were motivated to partner with Hospital Supervisory Agency.

Another reason was relative advantages which the Hospitals gained after being partnered with Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency. For example, the hospitals continued to improve their quality of services, received comprehensive guidance and had understanding of patients’ rights and obligations. Moreover, Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency could fulfill the conflict resolutions at the Hospitals. This is the reason of the accelerated establishment and execution of Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency.

In the first beginning, the roles of Yogyakarta Hospital Supervisory Agency were adjusted to the Central Hospital Supervisory Agency as the Regulation of Indonesian Ministry of Health No 88 of 2015 mentions. However, when it was adopted to the hospitals in Yogyakarta, the agency’s roles were considered upon the conditions related to hospital management and coordination between hospitals and provincial health office in Yogyakarta Province. This conditional adoption to the area where they supervise results in more applicable steps which the Hospital can take.

The Hospitals obtained little funding for providing healthcare services. Once Yogyakarta Province Hospital Supervisory Agency conducted mentoring and supervision, they found out a creative strategy to add some funds. Thus, they streamline the work flow to conduct services at the Hospitals.

Other informants said that even though at the first year, the employees of Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency did not get paid, they never felt discouraged to visit all hospitals. It proved that the employees supported to mentor and supervise the implementation of policies at the Hospitals. The sustainability of policy implementation, such as mentoring and supervision, depends each individual’s support.

Speaking from human resources, the number of employees of Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency is still lacking although there are 6 employees conducting mentoring and supervision. Viewed from the Regulation of Indonesian Government Number 49 of 2013 related to Hospital Supervisory Agency as the Agency should just assign maximum of 5 employees. However, one employee of those six is a contract worker under the Health Service Department of Yogyakarta Provincial Health Office. The recruitment of employees which exceeds the standard aims to solve a problem due to insufficient number of employees when conducting mentoring and supervision, thus it was expected to optimize the implementation of services.

“There was no specific job distribution. We usually sit together and discuss the issues we need to solve. We never questioned who solves the problem. The important thing is that we are able to solve the problem.” (Main Informant)

“If there is a problem or issue, Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency will discuss it together, analyze the problem, and ask the related party that disputes to reach an agreement of problem solution.” (Triangulation Informant 1)

Even though Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency only have a small team, they have showed great and effective team work to solve problems in Yogyakarta. Teamwork refers to interpersonal interactions and collaboration among team members in an organization. Effective teamwork is characterized with good communication and collaboration among team members as they work together to achieve common goals (Hwang, 2018).
Despite the virtuous team work, Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency have never provided a training about hospital mentoring and supervision for their employees as mediators even though it is needed. Training can enhance learning skills of the employees, improve work efficiency and organizational performance as well as help employee possess more skills (Mohan and Gomathi, 2015; Jyoti and Rani, 2017). Therefore, the employees require a proper training to do their role professionally as a certified mediator. As the primary informant as a representative of Ombudsman, a supervisory public service institution incorporated with Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency, stated a training certificate was so important for the mediators. Once a conflict is mediated by a certified mediator, the memorandum of understanding made by the certified mediator could be registered to the court that binds the parties to execute the agreement. It would also be a shock therapy for the disputing parties to obey the agreement.

Meanwhile, the budget given all this time was allocated from Local Government Budget according to the regulation of funding sources for Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency. A problem arising was insufficiency of funds and the reception flow of funds.

“The fund is not enough, but we try to make it enough. For us, fund is not an obstacle which makes our program cancelled. We have various strategies to make sure our program run with the minimum funds.” (Main Informant)

Until now, Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency perceived that the budget given was too little for conducting mentoring and supervision program. In other words, sufficiency of budget is vital to notice because it will affect the success of program implementation. To overcome insufficient funds, the employees of Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency made a creative idea by doing networking to help them implement the mentoring and supervision for the Hospitals.

Networking between hospitals and other related institutions becomes increasingly popular in the health sector. It is due to the needs of hospitals to have better understanding of challenges and issues in healthcare and to find a solution for problems at hospitals or share the best practice from each hospital (Loss et al., 2018). Networking has helped Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency socialize new issues about hospitals. This strategy can be a new way and sources for years to come. Hospital networking gives many benefits for hospitals in terms of financing, information sharing, and risk distribution (Reames, Anaya and Are, 2019). Therefore, hospital networking in Yogyakarta has a great contribution to supervision and guidance conducted by Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency.

Despite the sufficiency of funds, the reception of funds is still complicated because it was given to Yogyakarta Provincial Health Office first, then to Health Service Department. Next, it is transferred to Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency. Based on this flow, the Agency will not be the first hand receiving the funds.

Not to mention, infrastructures to support the hospital mentoring and supervision are available but still inadequate and not feasible because most of them are shared with the Health Service Department of Yogyakarta Provincial Health Office. While, in executing the mentoring and supervision, Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory have had Standard Operating Procedures (SOP). The SOPs come as a combined instrument between the central regulation and Yogyakarta’s specific condition. The instrument focuses on 5 aspects of hospital assessment which were summarized from 7 aspects.

“We made a standard instrument according to our team consensus. It was developed based on the regulation, and we adjusted the instrument to the hospitals’ condition and needs.” (Main Informant)

This instrument is very helpful for hospital mentoring and supervision in Yogyakarta as it simplifies the assessment process and becomes a solution to obtain similar and standard data of the entire Hospitals. Although each employee of Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency had their own tasks causing them not to visit the Hospitals in a complete formation. This instrument has standardized results as no matter who does the evaluation shall follow the standardized procedures which are suitable to the SOP. It showed that Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency have done well in implementing the hospital mentoring and supervision as they have a clear and standardized reference, thus the risks of bias occurrence can be minimized.

Before implementing a service, the Hospitals receive suggestions which result from the planning process done by Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency. They plan strategies for budgeted activities or non-budgeted activities, such as networking. The system planning is done every Monday when the employees of Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency gathered. Even such discussion has been made from the first time they were established. Planning activity of Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency is suitable with the meaning of planning itself, a continuously fundamental process of decision making done systematically.
Also, by doing planning stage, Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency have visionary and comprehensive ways of thinking because planning comprises of future direction, such as the analysis of available resources, the integration of government politicians’ supports, and community participation as the power to achieve the organization’s target.

Another thing found was that Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency have unfragmented obligation in the bureaucracy structure. They do not count an organizational structure important although a chairman has been assigned. All employees have the same level for problem solving and decision-making done with a mutual agreement. However, this kind of bureaucracy structure may result in the difficulty to determine the core team of the organization as a conflict occurs amongst the members. As it also happened to Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency, they did not think about the conflict resolution which can happen at any time.

This condition was an implication of the weak regulation regarding Hospital Supervisory Agency. For example, in as the Regulation of Indonesian Ministry of Health Regulation No. 17 of 2014 on Membership, Assignment, and Discontinuance of Indonesia Hospital Supervisory Agency Members and the Government Regulation No. 49 of 2013 on Hospital Supervisory Agency do not mention detailed positions and job distribution to all employees assigned for hospital mentoring and supervision.

It is noticeable that the hospital mentoring and supervision is a result of coordination between Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency, Health Service Department of Yogyakarta Provincial Health Office, the Hospitals, and stakeholders. They conduct the mentoring and supervision in 2 ways i.e. direct visitation and invitation to the entire hospitals in Yogyakarta to visit Yogyakarta Provincial Health Office and discuss the actual issues of the Hospitals.

Before the direct visitation, Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency sent a letter about the visitation agenda to the Hospitals and then split the team, which consist of the hospital members as well to survey all hospital areas. At the end, they would present all findings either positive or negative and give recommendations. After the implementation of hospital mentoring and supervision, Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency wrote a report of activities and submitted it to Yogyakarta Provincial Health Office. Then, Yogyakarta Provincial Health Office submitted the report to the Local Government and the Central Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency. To shorten the time of bureaucracy process, a copy of the report was also sent directly to the Central Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency by Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency. These procedures are in line with the Regulation of Indonesian Ministry of Health No. 88 of 2015 on Guidelines for Supervision, Reporting System, and Information System in Hospital Mentoring and Supervision by Hospital Supervisory Agency.

Not only that, Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency always promote themselves as a partner and colleague to the Hospitals, shaping more open and viable discussion which help the Hospitals become better.

“We already submitted our recommendations to the Hospitals in late 2018 and are still waiting for the response from Yogyakarta Provincial Health Office. However, we also gave recommendation directly to the Hospitals during our visit or discussion”. (Main Informant)

“There were several recommendations given to our hospital in form of a report a few days after hospital visitation. For simple recommendation which does not need a lot of funds, we execute it as soon as possible. However, for recommendation which needs a lot of funds, we usually adjust it first with the hospital budget.” (Triangulation Informant 2)

Furthermore, the follow-up reports were submitted at the end of in 2018. However, Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency just give the Hospitals personal recommendations that have been applied.

While, the process of monitoring and evaluation was still very lacking. Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency have not conducted structured, planned, and scheduled mentoring and evaluation until now. Research by Kennedy, Anastos and Genau (2019) showed that regular monitoring and evaluation, such as regular feedback session with hospital staffs, are an important part of healthcare management and the quality of service strategies. Improving the quality of service requires a comprehensive approach (Kennedy, Anastos and Genau, 2019). Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency have already implemented this concept with various approaches. However, it was not scheduled or regularly conducted due to the lack of the Hospitals’ human resource for quality management team.

The monitoring and evaluation by Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency are merely an individual appraisal of the implemented program, unimplemented program, and the future program. However, it is still not enough to be considered as monitoring and evaluation. The agenda need more detailed components which comprise of inputs (planning, organizing, and action), and outputs of the activities.
It is important to improve the quality of hospital monitoring. Research by Widyacahya and Wulandari (2018) showed that monitoring influences the team's performance of hospital management. Capable human resources in the team can optimize the monitoring and evaluation function and show better hospital performance (Widyacahya and Wulandari, 2018).

The communication among the employees of Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency is effective as they communicate routinely either online and directly in every-Monday meeting. Considering the job distributions to each member, these two ways of communication are applicable to optimize online messaging application where they can do their task and make a quick decision if something urgent happens. Communication has very important roles and positive impacts on work performance. Communication allows organizations to function optimally and creatively (Shoaib et al., 2017).

On the other side, the external communication between Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency with related parties was considered ineffective and not optimal. As the triangulation informant said, communication between Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency with the Hospitals was done only through email and letter before a one-year hospital visitation was done. The rare hospital visit occurs because there are a lot of hospitals in Yogyakarta. While, the team of Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency only consist of 6 people. Therefore, it was difficult to have intense and routine communication between hospitals and Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency.

Moreover, the policy brief of hospital mentoring and supervision has been well-delivered by Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency. It could be seen from the successful socialization about the establishment of Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency and dissemination of an integrated survey to the entire hospitals and community.

“Mentoring and supervision done by Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency are implemented in various ways. Sometimes we visit the hospital, but in other time we invite hospitals’ representatives to discuss current issues related to hospital.” (Main Informant)

“Sometimes Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency come and visit our hospital. They are divided into team. One team will assess our hospital management, and the other team accompanied by us will go around the Hospital.” (Triangulation Informant 2)

The transmission of the policy is unique as it is done with various ways, such as a direct survey to the Hospitals, invitation for the Hospitals to discuss about the policy of hospital mentoring and supervision, and broadcast on radio in forms of a talk show and open direct question and answer. During the implementation of socialization strategies, the Hospitals could use funds effectively and build a stronger image in the community.

Furthermore, the output variable showed that most of the targets have been reached. Nevertheless, due to the unstructured, unplanned, and unscheduled mentoring and evaluation, the attainment of the targets can just be described from the output, for example their success in conducting visitation to all hospitals in Yogyakarta Province. While other targets, such as the progress of service improvement, patient's empowerment and the community with rights and obligations of healthcare services are still on process. Since Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency did not perform detailed outputs, the indicators of success and standard assessment were remaining unknown. Whereas, those two indicators become the main point of mentoring and evaluation.

Another problem is finding no resolution for community’s complaints because there are no Governor Regulation and the lack of infrastructure to perform the task. Research by Kasnakoglu, Yilmaz and Varnali (2016) showed that an effective management of customer’s complaints has strong impacts on customer’s satisfaction and becomes concerns for improvement. Poor complaint management may result in difficulties to identify areas which need to improve (Tari Kasnakoglu, Yilmaz and Varnali, 2016).

As a result, Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency cannot fully implement the appropriate procedures of hospital mentoring and supervision as mandated in the Government Regulation No 49 of 2013. Even though this becomes an obstacle, the Hospitals have received benefits from the mentoring and supervision. For example, the Hospitals are more aware of their strengths and weaknesses and more enthusiastic to improve their performance and immediately prevent potential harms for patients. They also got great guidance, reminder, and supervision from Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency which has been considered as their partner. Other than that, Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency constantly recommend some applicable solutions which were easy to implement, resulting in an optimal improvement.

CONCLUSION

The success factors of Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital Supervisory Agency are determined by high commitment of the employees and well-built cooperation between Yogyakarta Provincial Hospital
Supervisory Agency and all hospitals in Yogyakarta. Well-built cooperation is the result of the Hospitals’ good acceptance of the mentoring and supervision.

REFERENCES


