**Original Research** 

# The Effect of Brand Positioning, Brand Image, and Perceived Price on Consumer Repurchase Intention Low-Cost Carrier

\*Dewa Ayu Abhinandati Prajna Pratisthita<sup>9</sup>, Putu Gde Arie Yudhistira<sup>9</sup>, Ni Ketut Wiwiek Agustina<sup>01</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Travel Business Management Study Program, Department of Tourism, Politeknik Pariwisata Bali, Badung, Indonesia Correspondence\*:

Address: Jl. Dharmawangsa, Kampial, Kuta Selatan, Badung, Bali, Indonesia 80361| e-mail: dewaayuanya@gmail.com

# Abstract

Objective: This study aims to examine the effect of brand positioning, brand image, and perceived price on the repurchase intention of low-cost carrier consumers.

Design/Methods/Approach: This study uses a purposive sampling technique to obtain a sample of 400 respondents who had used Citilink airline from I Gusti Ngurah Rai Airport. Data collection techniques are carried out by distributing online questionnaires using a Likert Scale points I to 5, which have been analyzed using SmartPLS 4 through the measurement model test (outer model), and structural model test (inner model).

Findings: The findings show that brand positioning has a positive effect on the repurchase intention of consumers of a low-cost carrier, brand image has a positive effect on the repurchase intention of consumers low-cost carrier, and the perceived price has a positive effect on the repurchase intention of consumers low-cost carrier.

Originality: This research adds dimensions to the variables of brand positioning, brand image, and perceived price and combines them to determine their effect on the repurchase intention of Indonesian low-cost airlines.

Practical/Policy Implications: Identifying the results of the variable brand positioning, brand image, and perceived price can measure repurchase intention for low-cost carrier consumers. This study provides low-cost carriers that the right brand positioning strategy, positive image, and price can create a consumer repurchase intention.

Keywords: Brand Positioning, Brand Image, Perceived Price, Repurchase Intention

JEL Classification: M30, M31



DOI: https://doi.org/10.20473/jmtt.v15i2.35715 Received: (May 8, 2022) Revised: (July 27, 2022) Accepted: (August 3, 2022) Published: (August 27, 2022) Copyright © Dewa Ayu Abhinandati Prajna Pratisthita, Putu Gde Arie Yudhistira, Ni Ketut Wiwiek Agustina 2022 Published by Universitas Airlangga, Department of Management, Faculty of Economics and Business JURNAL MANAJEMEN This article is published under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 (CC-BY) International License. The full terms of this TEOR DATA TERAPAN license may be seen at: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/

#### I. Introduction

In this era of globalization, the economic sector is the most important thing for a country. One sector supporting national economic growth is the industrial sector (Kemenperin, 2017). The importance of the industrial sector provides the potential to create macro and microeconomic development. The aviation industry is one of the industrial sectors that can revive the national economy (DJPU, 2018). The Decree of the Minister of Transportation number 81 of 2004 concerning establishing an airline company in Indonesia has opened up business opportunities for commercial aviation.

Along with the development of times and technology, air transportation has become one of the components that have advantages in travelling long distances because it is fast, safe, and efficient for the community (Dileep & Kurien, 2021). Air growth factors are divided into four categories: globalization, liberalization, and production (Cook & Billig, 2017). The growth of air travel causes airlines to compete to provide the best air transportation services and requires airlines to form a marketing strategy (Ambrose & Waguespack, 2021).

Marketing strategy can be done by selecting segmentation, targeting, and determining market position (Kotler et al., 2021). Based on Law Number I (2009) concerning flights in article 97, the types and levels of scheduled commercial airlines in Indonesia are divided into three, services with maximum standards (full service), medium service, and services with minimum standards (no-frills) or low-cost carrier (LCC). Currently, low-cost carrier airline services are often found in Indonesia. The development of low-cost carrier airlines has led to higher consumer choices, thus encouraging airline companies to strengthen their brands by developing positioning strategies (Kearns, 2021). Maharani and Andrianto's research (2014) states that brand positioning elaborates a branding strategy where brand positioning is a communication strategy to enter the consumer's window so that the product contains meaning (Kotler & Armstrong, 2021). The right brand positioning strategy will improve brand image and increase sales (Chelumbrun in Obasi, 2022).

Aaker in Anang (2019) said that a strong brand must have a strong position. A strong positioning will make a brand more embedded in consumers' memories. When the brand is increasingly embedded in consumers' memories, an image will be created in the minds of consumers (Diallo et al., 2013). Brand image is created when a strong and unique brand is connected in the minds of consumers because brand knowledge is seen from the perspective of consumer memory (Dirsehan & Kurtulus, 2018). Brand image is represented by all perceptions formed from past experiences (Arif, 2019). Therefore, perceptions formed from the past result in a person having repurchase intentions (Suryana & Dasuki, 2013) because the brand must make a person have a good and meaningful emotional experience (Santos & Silva, 2019).

Emotional experiences are the basis for forming consumer perceptions or interpretations of the relative prices or sacrifices that must be incurred (Arifin et al., 2013). Low-cost carrier airlines use a strategy of suppressing operational costs and cost efficiency (Hawa Bunga & Mawardi, 2017), making perceived price the basis for a person's decision to choose a brand based on the lowest or highest price (Tuten, 2019). Perceived price describes consumers' emotional experience of getting a product that can be a positive or negative signal (Yasri et al., 2020). Someone will repeat purchases for well-known products or known to the wider community regardless of whether the product is expensive or cheap (Akir & Othman, 2010). Savila et al. (2019) explain that repurchase intention is used to buy goods or services after making the previous purchase for the umpteenth time.

Based on research by Juwairiya (2019) and Han et al. (2019), brand image positively affects the repurchase intention of low-cost carrier consumers. Juwairiyah's (2019) and Suhaily & Soelasih's (2017) research also state a positive effect of the price variable on repurchase intentions. This finding contradicts the research of Andiyanto et al. (2019), which states that the price variable does not have a positive effect on repurchase intentions. Research by Asshidiq (2017), Amadi (2022), and Situmorang et al. (2021) states that brand positioning has a positive effect on repurchase intentions. Based on previous research, different results from the price variable need to be reviewed on consumers' repurchase intentions. Amadi's research (2022) has limited dimensions by using one variable dimension so that the researcher provides suggestions for further research to add more dimensional elements to the variables of brand positioning, brand image, and perceived price. In addition, previous research recommends developing or combining positioning, brand image, and perceived price must be considered by low-cost carrier airlines in Indonesia to achieve a consumer repurchase intention to see that low-cost carriers are growing, which causes consumer choice to be higher. Therefore, this study aimed to determine the effect of brand positioning, brand image, and perceived price on repurchase intention in low-cost carrier consumers.

This research makes several contributions. First, we strengthen the concept of variables from the limitations of previous studies. Thus, we add literature on the dimensions of the variables, brand positioning, brand image, and perceived price. Second, this study ensures that brand positioning, brand image and perceived price influence repurchase intentions among domestic consumers with low-cost carriers. Third, this study also adds age and gender variables. This can strongly influence repurchase intentions in terms of the age and gender of consumers with low-cost carrier

consumer repurchase intentions. Fourth, this study contributes to the overall literature on marketing to low-cost carrier airlines, directly and indirectly, influencing consumers' repurchase intentions. Finally, the research results on brand positioning, brand image, and perceived price can be followed up and implied by the company to increase consumer repurchase intention.

The next section of the article explains and discusses the conceptual influence of brand positioning, brand image, and perceived price on repurchase intention in the context of low-cost carrier airlines in Indonesia. The discussion of the conceptual framework can be developed into article hypotheses. In sections three and four, this article describes the research methodology included in the research results. Section five is the last section which contains the conclusions as well as the implications and limitations of the study.

# 2. Literature Review and Hypotheses Development

### **Brand Positioning**

Brand positioning is an important step in marketing strategy (Alzate et al., 2022). Brand positioning is formed by perceptions, images, emotions and how consumers compare with competing products. To position a product, the company needs to understand the consumer category (Amadi, 2022). Brand positioning is based on three levels of dimensions. In the first dimension, the company can position the brand on its attributes. In the second dimension, the brand can be positioned better by associating with the desired benefits, and in the third dimension, the strongest brand is positioned on beliefs and values. Positioning is successful if carried out stably and sustainably (Kotler et al., 2021). The purpose of brand positioning is to keep the brand at the top position in the minds of consumers when they are considering a purchase. A brand positioning strategy must differentiate the brand from competitors, address important consumer buying criteria, and understand key brand attributes (Amadi, 2022).

### **Repurchase Intention**

Repurchase intention is a person's intention to repurchase a product purchased in the past (Megantara & Suryani, 2016). Chou and Chen (2018) define repurchase intention as a person's assessment of buying products or services from the same brand in the future by considering the current situation. Meanwhile, Ibzan et al. (2016) explain that repurchase is a real customer action to buy or reuse the product. According to Putri (2016), consumer repurchase interest factors include brand preferences, product quality, perceived value, and price. Companies must have the right price and positioning strategy to form repurchase intention. It will improve the brand image and ultimately increase sales (Obasi & Amadi, 2022). Thus, repurchase intention is buying behaviour from consumers towards a product or service that is carried out repeatedly within a certain period and continuously likes and has a positive attitude towards a product or service, based on experiences that have been carried out in the past (Suryana & Dasuki, 2013). Ferdinand (2014) stated that repurchase intention has four dimensions: transactional intentions, referential intentions, preferential intentions, and exploratory intentions. Andreani et al. (2017) research suggests five new internal and external factor analyses that can be extracted, experiential factor, customer, needs factor, practical factor, amusement factor, and life-cycle factor that affect customer purchase LCC intentions. The biggest contribution is the experience factor of having good experiences with LCCs, whereas the least is the customer life-cycle factor. In Liu & Lee's (2016) research exploring the important LCC attributes of service quality, value evaluation, service price, and marketing strategies can influence their experience of return repurchase intentions. This finding plays an important role in various aspects of perceived value in the marketing strategy-making process. Ayutthaya's (2018) research reveals that if LCC airlines can create a positive brand image in customers' minds, it can encourage customers to make repurchase intentions on low-cost carrier airlines.

### **Relationship between Brand Positioning and Repurchase Intention**

Putri (2016) revealed that brand preference influences consumer repurchase interest. A preference for a brand is formed when the company's product communication strategy can enter the consumer's window so that the product contains meaning (Kotler & Armstrong, 2021). This communication strategy is a form of brand positioning (Waguespack, 2020). The first hypothesis is that brand positioning significantly and positively affects repurchase intention. This is supported by research by Situmorang et al. (2021), which states that green brand positioning significantly affects repurchase intention. Then, Asshidiq's research (2017) also shows that product repurchase decisions can be positively influenced by the positioning of consumers who make product repurchase decisions. This indicates that the ultimate goal of positioning is to form a product's value in a consumer, creating a convincing reason why they should buy the product (Kotler & Armstrong, 2021).

# H<sub>1</sub>: Brand Positioning has a positive effect on Repurchase Intention.

#### **Brand Image**

Brand image is a growing consumer belief about each brand's attributes (Kotler et al., 2021). Meanwhile, Nisar and Whitehead (2016) stated that brand image is the total consumer image received by a brand, including differentiation from other brands, brand personality, and profit commitment. According to Deliana in Aristana et al. (2022), brand image is defined as perceptions and beliefs made by consumers, which are reflected in associations that occur in consumers' memories. The more embedded in the consumer's memory, a brand will be closer to the consumer of choice. Brand Image relates to brand names where names and other brand symbols act to retrieve information about brand associations and their perceptions of the brand from memory (Tuten, 2019). According to Keller (2013), brand image is tested through three dimensions: strength, uniqueness, and favourable.

# **Relationship between Brand Image and Repurchase Intention**

Diallo et al. (2013) reveal that brand image is used as the basis for consumer understanding of a brand. The brand image represents the overall brand perception formed from past information and brand experiences (Arif, 2019). Therefore, perceptions formed from the past result in a person's intention to repurchase the product (Suryana & Dasuki, 2013). The second hypothesis is that brand image significantly and positively affects repurchase intention. This is supported by research by Huang et al.(2019), which states that brand image positively affects the repurchase intention of ecotourism products. Likewise, research by Yasa (2018), Rakatama and Winarto (2021), and Lianto (2018) states that brand image has a positive and significant influence on consumer repurchase intention.

# H<sub>2</sub>: Brand Image has a positive effect on Repurchase Intention

### **Perceived Price**

Kotler et al. (2021) define price as the amount charged for products, goods, and services. Pricing decisions incorporate demand, perceived value, price comparisons, costs, and pricing strategies (Tuten, 2019). Perception is a process that occurs due to a sensation where sensation is an activity to feel or cause an exciting, emotional state (Setiadi, 2019). Perceived Price refers to the subjective form of the monetary value of the product, such as whether a product is cheap or expensive, and the consideration of consumer purchasing power (Calvo-Porral & Lévy-Mangin, 2017). George (2021) stated that the perceived price is the number of sacrifices individuals must make to consume the product and the level of quality that one might expect. Perceived price is also a consumer's perception or interpretation of the relative price or sacrifice that must be spent to get a product compared to the price or sacrifice of other similar products (Arifin et al., 2013). Confidence in good prices is used to evaluate existing prices by consumers at the time of purchase and is a dynamic structure of price information in consumers' memories (Büyükdağ et al., 2020). According to Janiszewski and Cunha (2004), the dimensions of perceived price include attractiveness and fairness.

### **Relationship between Perceived Price and Repurchase Intention**

When consumers feel that the product price is reasonable and has good quality and value, they tend to share their opinion with their friends (Moslehpour et al., 2017). The fair price will trigger the consumer's repurchase intention (Suhaily & Soelasih, 2017). The third hypothesis is that perceived price has a significant positive effect on repurchase intention. This is supported by research by Liu and Lee (2016), which states that perceived price can increase repurchase intention. Yasri's research (2020) states that perceived price affects Gen Y's repurchase intention. Furthermore, Wibisono (2018) and Stefano's research (2019) showed that perceived price positively affects repurchase intention. This shows that the better the perceived price, the stronger the customer's repurchase intention.

### H<sub>3</sub>: Perceived Price has a positive effect on Repurchase Intention.



Figure I. Research Model

# 3. Method

This study uses a quantitative approach where data is obtained by distributing online questionnaires via Google Form using Likert scale points I (one) to 5 (five). The sampling technique was carried out using a purposive sampling technique which is the sampling is confined to specific types of people who can provide the desired information, either because they are the only ones who have it or they conform to some criteria set by the researcher (Sekaran & Bougie, 2016). This consideration is the sample criteria for this study: consumers who have used Citilink from I Gusti Ngurah Rai Airport (Denpasar). Citilink Indonesia is one of the low-cost airline subsidiaries of Garuda Indonesia. In 2021 there will be a 2.7% decrease in passengers on the Citilink Denpasar airline (data processed by Citilink, 2022). The sample in this study was calculated using the Taro Yamane (1973) formula approach, which resulted in 400 respondents. Data were analyzed using SmartPLS 4 (Ringle et al., 2022).

Hair et al. (2021) Partial least squares structural equation modelling is a variance-based method to estimate structural equation models. The goal is to maximize the explained variance of the endogenous latent variables. Thus, SEM is a class of multivariate techniques that combine aspects of factor analysis and regression, enabling the researcher to simultaneously examine relationships among measured and latent variables and between latent variables (Hair et al., 2021). The SmartPLS4 analysis is tested through the measurement model test (outer model), structural model test (inner model), and partial hypothesis testing through path coefficients. This study has independent variables, including brand positioning, brand image, and perceived price, the dependent variable is repurchase intention, and the control variables are age and gender. The operational definitions of variables in this study can be seen in table 1.

Variables	Dimensions	Indicator	Source	
	Attributes	X1.1.2 Positioning the brand on attractive products according to the target market.		
Brand Positioning	Benefit	X1.2.1 Positioning the brand by offering advantages and benefits to consumers.		
(X <sub>1</sub> )	Beliefs and Value	<ul><li>X1.3.1 Positioning the brand with confidence in the minds of consumers</li><li>X1.3.2 Positioning the brand on strong values to create a surprise and excitement in the minds of every consumer.</li></ul>	Kotler et al. (2021)	
Brand Image (X <sub>2</sub> )	Strengths	<ul><li>X2.1.1   Products at affordable prices.</li><li>X2.1.2 Attractive promotions for consumers.</li><li>X2.1.3 Provide the best facilities and services for its customers.</li></ul>	Keller (2013)	

Table I. Definition of Operational Variables

	Uniqueness	X2.2.1 Unique logo and design with features that set it apart from other airlines. X2.2.2 Unique service.	
	Favourable	X2.3.1 Branding is easy to remember. X2.3.2 Branding is easy to pronounce. X2.3.3 Have a positive impression.	
	Attractiveness	X3.1 Attractive prices to offer.	Janiszewki and Cunha
Perceived Price (X <sub>3</sub> )	Fairness	X3.2 Reasonable price offered.	(2004)
	Transactional intent	Y1.1 Always willing to repurchase products that have been purchased.	
Repurchase Intention	Referral intent	YI.2 Always recommend products that others have purchased.	Ferdinand (2014)
(Y)	Preferential intention	Y1.3 Always choose a product that has been purchased over other products.	
	Exploratory intent	YI.4 Always find out information from the product.	

# 4. Result and Discussion

# **Characteristics of Respondents**

The characteristics of the total respondents (n) = 400 consisting of gender, age, and employment status can be seen in Table 2 as follows:

	n	%
Gender		
Woman	237	59%
Men	163	41%
Total	400	100%
Employment status		
Student	175	44%
Employees	119	30%
Civil Servant	36	8%
Entrepreneur	51	13%
Other	19	5%
Total	400	100%
Age		
18 - 25 years	235	59%
26 - 35 years	77	19%
36 - 45 years	47	12%
46 - 55 years	26	7%
> 55 years	15	3%
Total	400	100%

Based on table 2 above, 400 respondents answered, 237 respondents were women (59%), and 163 respondents (41%) were men. It can be concluded that most respondents in this study are female. Most respondents ranged from 18-25 years old for the age category, with as many as 235 respondents (59%). Furthermore, most respondents are students of employment status, as many as 175 people (44%). Based on the characteristics of the respondents described previously, these respondents have met the requirements and deserve to be respondents in this study because these respondents have used Citilink airline from I Gusti Ngurah Rai Airport.

# Measurement Model (Outer Model Evaluation Result)

The measurement model test (outer model) includes validity and reliability tests. The validity test was conducted to determine the ability of the research instrument to measure what it was supposed to measure. Meanwhile, the reliability test is used to measure the consistency of measuring instruments in measuring a concept or the consistency

of respondents in answering questions in the questionnaire (Hair et al., 2021). The following is a picture of the measurement of the output model.



Figure 2. PLS Path Model

# **Convergent Validity Test**

The convergent validity test can be seen from the value of the loading factor. The rule of thumb usually used to assess this validity is that the loading factor above 0.6 is still acceptable with the Average Variance Extracted (AVE) value beingreater than 0.5 (Hair et al., 2021).

	ltem Code	Outer Loading	AVE	Conclusion
Brand Positioning	XI.I.I	0.701	0.542	Valid
	XI.2.I	0.763		Valid
	XI.3.I	0.731		Valid
	XI.3.2	0.749		Valid
Brand Image	X2.1.1	0.669	0.518	Valid
	X2.1.2	0.698		Valid
	X2.1.3	0.719		Valid
	X2.2.1	0.712		Valid
	X2.2.2	0.696		Valid
	X2.3.1	0.772		Valid
	X2.3.2	0.722		Valid
	X2.3.3	0.764		Valid
Perceived Price	X3.I	0.898	0.788	Valid
	X3.2	0.877		Valid
Repurchase Intention	YI.I	0.787	0.626	Valid
	Y1.2	0.793		Valid

Table 3.	Convergent	Validity	y
----------	------------	----------	---

	YI.3	0.801		Valid
	YI.4	0.784		Valid
Gender	Gender	1.000	1.000	Valid
Age	Age	1.000	1.000	Valid

Source: SmartPLS 4 Output (2022)

In this study, there are four constructs and two-variable control wherefrom the analysis results above, and it can be seen that all constructs produce a loading factor value > 0.06 which means that all construct indicators are valid. The rule of thumb usually used to assess this validity is that the loading factor value between 0.6 - 0.7 is still acceptable, with the Average Variance Extracted (AVE) value being greater than 0.5 (Hair et al., 2021). Based on the test results of the measurement model shown in the picture above, it can be explained as follows (1) Age and Gender as variables control have a loading factor above 0.6, and AVE > 0.5, (2) The brand positioning construct as measured by the indicators X1.1.1, X1.2.1, X1.3.2, X1.3.2 have a loading factor above 0.6, and AVE >0.5, (3) The brand image construct as measured by the indicators X2.1.1, X2.1.2, X2.1.3, X2.2.1, X2.2.2, X2.3.1, X2.3.2, X2.3.3 have a loading factor above 0.6 and AVE > 0.5, (4) The perceived price construct as measured by the X3.1 and X3.2 indicators have a loading factor above 0.6 and AVE > 0.5, (4) Also, the repurchase intention constructs as measured by the Y1.1, Y1.2, Y1.3, Y1.4 have a loading factor above 0.6 and AVE > 0.5.

### **Discriminant Validity Test**

The validity test tested the Heterotrait-Monotrait Ratio value, which was useful to determine whether the construct had an adequate discriminant. HTMT value above 0.90 or 0.85 when the constructs in the path model are conceptually more distinct suggests a lack of discriminant validity (Hair et al., 2021). Thus, all constructs in the extended model exhibit discriminant validity based on the HTMT method.

	Age	Brand Image	Brand Positioning	Gender	Perceived Price	Repurchase Intention
Age						
Brand Image	0.207					
Brand Positioning	0.154	0.789				
Gender	0.041	0.031	0.050			
<b>Perceived Price</b>	0.129	0.653	0.762	0.041		
Repurchase Intention	0.259	0.792	0.869	0.021	0.737	

Table 4. Heterotrait-Monotrait Ratio

Source: SmartPLS 4 Output (2022)

The Heterotrait-Monotrait Ratio value in table 4 shows that the value of each construct is not more than 0.9, which means that each construct is declared valid on discriminant validity.

# **Reliability Test**

Table 5. Discriminant Reliability Test Result

	Cronbach's Alpha	rho_A	Composite Reliability	Conclusion
Brand Positioning	0.720	0.723	0.826	Reliable
Brand Image	0.867	0.868	0.896	Reliable
Perceived Price	0.731	0.735	0.881	Reliable
Repurchase Intention	0.801	0.802	0.870	Reliable
Gender	1.000	1.000	1.000	Reliable
Age	1.000	1.000	1.000	Reliable

Source: SmartPLS 4 Output (2022)

The Rule of Thumb used to assess the Cronbach Alpha is > 0.6 for Exploratory Research (Hair et al., 2021). Based on the results of the Cronbach's Alpha test in table 5 above, the Cronbach's Alpha value of each construct is above 0.6, so it can be stated that the gauge used in this study is reliable where Age and Gender as variables of control has a value of 1.000 greater than 0.6, Brand Image construct has a value of 0.867 which is greater than 0.6, Brand Positioning has a value of 0.720 greater than 0.6, Perceived Price construct has a value of 0.731 greater than 0.6, and Repurchase Intention construct has a value of 0.801 greater than 0.6.

Composite reliability is considered better if the construct has a value > 0.7 (Hair et al., 2021). So, it can be concluded above that each construct has high reliability where Age and Gender as variables control have a value of 1.000, Brand Image construct has a value of 0.896, Brand Positioning has a value of 0.826, Perceived Price has a value of 0.881, and Repurchase Intention has a value of 0.870, all of which are above 0.7.

### **Structural Model (Inner Model Evaluation Results)**

According to Hair et al. (2021), the structural model is an element of a PLS path model that contains the constructs and the relationships between them. It is also called the inner model in PLS-SEM. The structural model and the significance were carried out using the bootstrapping method. Bootstrapping is a nonparametric procedure that tests the statistical significance of various PLS-SEM results such as path coefficient, Cronbach's Alpha, and R-Square (Ringle et al., 2022).

	Original Sample (O)	Sample Mean (M)	Standard Deviation (STDEV)	T Statistics ( O/STDEV )	P Values
XI.I.I <- Brand Positioning	0.701	0.700	0.033	21.534	0.000
XI.2.1 <- Brand Positioning	0.763	0.762	0.028	27.579	0.000
XI.3.1 <- Brand Positioning	0.731	0.730	0.028	26.007	0.000
X1.3.2 <- Brand Positioning	0.749	0.750	0.026	28.354	0.000
X2.I.I <- Brand Image	0.669	0.665	0.037	18.088	0.000
X2.1.2 <- Brand Image	0.698	0.696	0.033	21.187	0.000
X2.1.3 <- Brand Image	0.719	0.719	0.034	21.241	0.000
X2.2.1 <- Brand Image	0.712	0.709	0.033	21.467	0.000
X2.2.2 <- Brand Image	0.696	0.693	0.036	19.144	0.000
X2.3.1 <- Brand Image	0.772	0.770	0.028	27.854	0.000
X2.3.2 <- Brand Image	0.722	0.719	0.038	18.952	0.000
X2.3.3 <- Brand Image	0.764	0.761	0.031	24.932	0.000
X3.1 <- Perceived Price	0.898	0.897	0.013	69.307	0.000
X3.2 <- Perceived Price	0.877	0.876	0.018	47.594	0.000
YI.I <- Repurchase Intention	0.787	0.787	0.024	33.202	0.000
YI.2 <- Repurchase Intention	0.793	0.793	0.024	32.703	0.000
Y1.3 <- Repurchase Intention	0.801	0.797	0.021	38.550	0.000
YI.4 <- Repurchase Intention	0.784	0.781	0.025	30.771	0.000
Gender <- Gender	1.000	1.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
Age <- Age	1.000	1.000	0.000	0.000	0.000

Table 6. Outer Loadings Structural Model (Inner Model Evaluation Result)

Source: SmartPLS 4 Output (2022)

Table 6 above is the result of the structural model's outer loading, which can be concluded that all reflective construct indicators are valid with the resulting T-statistics value > 1.96 (Hair et al., 2021). In assessing the structural model, it begins by looking at the R-Square for exogenous variables to endogenous latent variables having a substantive effect, the path coefficient values or t-values for each path to test the significance between constructs in the structural model. R-Squares values of 0.75, 0.50, and 0.25 can be concluded that the model is strong, moderate, and weak (Hair et al., 2021).

### Table 7. R-Square

	R Square	R Square Adjusted
Repurchase Intention	0.579	0.573
Source: SmartPLS 4 Output (2022)		

-----

The R-Square value of Repurchase Intention is 0.579. Therefore, 57.9% of variances in the Repurchase Intention are determined by Brand Positioning, Brand Image, Perceived Price, Age, and Gender. In other words, 42.1% of the variances are determined by other factors which are not included in the model. Thus, the model is classified as moderate.

### **Hypothesis Testing Results**

Hypothesis Testing Result looks at the probability value and its t-statistics. The p-value with 5% alpha for probability values is less than 0.05. The t-table value for 5% alpha is 1.96. So, the criteria for acceptance of the hypothesis when t-statistics > t-table (Hair et al., 2021). The results of the hypothesis in Table 9 below show that all have supported the hypothesis.

#### Table 9. Path Coefficient

Hypothesis	Path	Std. Beta	Std. Error	t- value	p- value	Bias	Interv	ident al Bias ected	Decision
							5.0%	<b>95.0</b> %	_
ні	Brand Positioning → Repurchase Intention Brand Image	0.338	0.067	5.067	0.000	0.003	0.237	0.458	Supported
H2	→ Repurchase Intention	0.328	0.062	5.264	0.000	0.003	0.222	0.427	Supported
H3	Perceived Price → Repurchase Intention	0.196	0.056	3.514	0.000	-0.004	0.107	0.290	Supported
	Gender $\rightarrow$ Repurchase Intention	0.047	0.066	0.725	0.234	-0.000	-0.060	0.154	Not Supported
ource: SmartPLS 4 C	Age → Repurchase Intention	0.105	0.028	3.690	0.000	-0.001	0.061	0.154	Supported

Source: SmartPLS 4 Output (2022)

The results of testing the first hypothesis (H1) using path coefficients get a p-value that is less than 0.05, which is 0.000, and for t-statistics, it gets 5.067 which means it is above 1.96. These results indicate a positive effect on brand positioning on repurchase intention. Brand positioning is a step in marketing strategy (Alzate et al., 2022), where brand positioning is formed from a set of perceptions, images, and emotions. This shows that positioning is influenced by perception and image, so the ultimate goal of positioning is the formation of a product's value in a consumer that creates a convincing reason why they should buy the product (Kotler & Armstrong, 2021). Research Herng et al. (2012) state that the strategy of low-cost carrier airlines highlights the development of processes for creating value for companies and customers. Marketing managers must evaluate companies from four perspectives: financial performance, customer knowledge, internal business processes, and learning & growth. Citilink can position its position according to the target by providing benefits, beliefs, and strong values in the minds of consumers. The company must be more aggressive in building a positive image to create consumer repurchase intentions. These results agree with Asshidiq's research (2017) which shows that positioning positively influences the decision to repurchase because positive perceptions and consumer confidence in a product will create a good positioning. Similarly, a study by Situmorang et al. (2021) shows that brand positioning affects the repurchase intentions of brands.

The results of testing the second hypothesis (H2) using path coefficients get a p-value less than 0.05, which is 0.000, and for t-statistics, it gets 5.264 above 1.96. So, there is a positive effect on the brand image on repurchase

intention. Brand Image will be used as the basis for consumer understanding and perception of a brand (Diallo et al., 2013). The perception formed causes a person to have the intention to repurchase the product (Suryana & Dasuki, 2013). The influence of brand image causes the repurchase intention of Citilink consumers. The importance of the brand image on Citilink airlines requires companies to provide positive information in terms of service, price, quality, and uniqueness, one of which Citilink always inserts into its consumers' poetry; this makes the Citilink brand more embedded in consumers' memories. This result is also supported by Han et al. (2019) research, which shows that the brand image variable significantly affects the repurchase intention of low-cost carriers in South Korea. In addition, Ayutthaya's (2018) research reveals that if LCC airlines can create a positive brand image in customers' minds, it can encourage customers to make repurchase intentions on low-cost carrier airlines.

The results of testing the third hypothesis (H3) using path coefficients get a p-value less than 0.05, which is 0.000, with a t-statistic of 3.514 above 1.96. So, there is a positive effect on the perceived price variable on the repurchase intention variable. Perceived price is a consumer's perception or interpretation of the relative price or sacrifice that must be incurred to get a product compared to the price or sacrifice of other similar products (Arifin et al., 2013). Price is a person's decision in choosing a brand (Tuten, 2019). This price perception triggers consumer repurchase intentions (Suhaily & Soelasih, 2017). Kotler et al. (2021) revealed that perception is influenced by selective memory, where a person will retain important information to support their beliefs. In this case, Citilink, a low-cost carrier that uses a cost reduction strategy, already has reasonable and attractive consumer price information. This result is supported by Pang & Truong's (2018) research suggests that expected price has a strong positive influence on consumer choice of LCC. Among all factors, the price strongly influences the intention to use LCC in China. These findings support the dominant impact of price on passenger decisions in emerging LCC markets. This also shows that LCC passengers are price sensitive and will consider price first when choosing LCC as a mode of transportation. However, this study does not align with Kevin and Tjokrosaputro's (2021) research, where the perceived price variable does not positively influence the repurchase intention variable.

The result of gender as a control variable has a p-value of more than 0.005, where gender has no significant effect on repurchase intention, meaning that both men and women have the same repurchase intention on Citilink's low-cost carrier airlines. This result is supported by Kim et al. (2012) research that gender has no significant effect on repurchase intention. However, the control variable, Age, has a p-value below 0.005, which means that there is a tendency that the higher the age, the greater the repurchase on Citilink's low-cost carrier. This result is in line with the Chiu and Cho (2019) research where the quality brand effect is stronger for consumers than 40 years compared to younger consumers toward repurchase intentions. This finding is also under research by Lian and Yen (2014) that older consumers perceive quality and find it beneficial. They will have higher levels of purchase intention.

# 5. Conclusion

This study aims to examine the effect of brand positioning, brand image, and perceived price on repurchase intention so that after testing and interpreting the results of data analysis, the following conclusions can be drawn brand positioning has a positive effect on the repurchase intention of consumers low-cost carrier. Brand image has a positive effect on the repurchase intention of consumers' low-cost carriers. The perceived price has a positive effect on the repurchase intention of consumers' low-cost carriers.

This research is expected to contribute theoretically and practically. Theoretically, brand positioning is a company's marketing strategy. Low-cost carrier airline's strategy is to develop processes to create value for the company and customers. Citilink can position its position on target by providing benefits, beliefs, and strong values in the minds of consumers in creating repurchase intentions. Second, Brand Image is used as a consumer's perception of a brand that causes someone to have the intention to repurchase the product.

In contrast, Citilink airlines require companies to provide positive information regarding service, price, quality, and uniqueness, one of which Citilink always inserts into its consumers' poetry; this makes the Citilink brand more embedded in consumers' memories. In the memories of consumers, this makes the Citilink brand more embedded in consumers' memories. Third, perceived price is used as a consumer's perception or interpretation of the relative price or sacrifice that must be made. It is this price perception that triggers consumer repurchase intentions. In this case, Citilink, a low-cost airline with a cost reduction strategy, already has reasonable and attractive price information for consumers.

It is practically contributing to Citilink Indonesia Denpasar to pay more attention to always innovating and paying attention to existing products by providing meaningful benefits, advantages, and value to consumer expectations, improving service quality, providing the best facilities for its customers, and maintaining the company's reputation and pay attention to prices by often providing promo prices to attract consumers' intention to repurchase to compete with other low-cost airlines. The limitations of this study are that this research was conducted on Citilink Denpasar consumers. The sample of this study is not a perfect representation of all Citilink passengers in Indonesia because the researcher conducted this research in Bali. So it can be a suggestion for further research to develop research with a wider object. In addition, further research will explore more variables and theories used to determine the effect on repurchase intention by developing analytical methods and reinforcing the concept between variables.

# Acknowledgement

The authors would like to thank the anonymous referees for their useful comments, which allowed to increase the value of this article.

### **Author Contribution**

Author I: conceptualization, original draft, data curation, formal analysis, investigation, methodology. Author 2: review and editing, writing review and editing, supervision, validation, visualization.

Author 3: review and editing, writing review and editing, supervision, validation, visualization.

### **Financial Disclosure**

This article is not funded or related to any funding agency.

# **Conflict of Interest**

The authors declare that the research was conducted without any commercial or financial relationships construed as a potential conflict of interest.

# References

- Adeline Felicia Lianto. (2018). Pengaruh Trust, Perceived Value, Brand Image dan Satisfaction terhadap Repurchase Intention Batik Air di Jakarta dan Tangerang. Jurnal Manajemen Bisnis Dan Kewirausahaan, 02, 62–68.
- Akir, O., & Othman, M. N. (2010). Consumers' Shopping Behaviour Pattern on Selected Consumer Goods: Empirical Evidence from Malaysian Consumers. International Review of Business Research Papers, 6, 279–294. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/265109018
- Alzate, M., Arce-Urriza, M., & Cebollada, J. (2022). Mining the text of online consumer reviews to analyze brand image and brand positioning. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 67, 102989. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jretconser.2022.102989
- Amadi, L. (2022). Effect of Brand Packaging Positioning Strategy on Customer's Behavioural Intentions towards Food and Beverage Products: Evidence from Nigeria. World Bulletin of Social Sciences (WBSS), 7, 43–53. https://www.scholarexpress.net
- Ambrose, S., & Waguespack, B. (2021). Fundamentals of Airline Marketing. Taylor & Francis. https://books.google.co.id/books?id=IJ8IEAAAQBAJ
- Anang, F. (2019). Pemasaran Produk dan Merek (planning & strategy). Surabaya: CV. Penerbit Qiara Media.
- Andiyanto, A., Ato'illah, M., & Fauziah, A. (2019). Price and Brand Image Analysis of Interest in Buying Re Madjank Store Brand Products. Proceedings Progress Conference, 2(2), 251–254.
- Andreani, F., Stephanie, M. A., & Putri, E. P. D. (2017). Why do Customers Intend to Repurchase Low Cost Carriers (LCCS) in Indonesia? International Journal of Applied Business and Economic Research, 15. www.serialsjournals.com
- Arif, M. E. (2019). Brand Image, and Price on Re-Purchase Intention of Airline Customers. *Journal of Applied Management*, 17(2), 345–356. https://doi.org/10.21776/ub.jam.2019.017.02.18
- Arifin, S., Suharyono, & Wilopo. (2013). Pengaruh Perceived Price Dan Perceived Value Pada Produk Bundling Terhadap Minat Beli (Sebuah Survei Tentang Minat Beli Perangkat Komunikasi Pada Mahasiswa). Jurnal Administrasi Bisnis (JAB), 1, 168–176.

- Aristana, I. K. G. A., Yudhistira, P. G. A., & Sasmita, M. T. (2022). The Influence of Brand Image and Brand Trust on Consumer Loyalty (Case Study on Consumers of PT Citilink Indonesia Branch Office Denpasar). *Tourism Research Journal*, 6(1). https://doi.org/10.30647/trj.v6i1.129
- Asshidiq, H. (2017). Pengaruh Positioning dan Persepsi Iklan Dengan Keputusan Pembelian Ulang Produk Air Mineral Aqua Pada Remaja Akhir. *Psikoborneo: Jurnal Ilmiah Psikologi*, 5(4).
- Ayutthaya, S. S. N. (2018). Impact of Perceived Service on Brand Image and Repurchase Intentions of Thai Passengers towards Low Cost Carriers. AU Journal of Management, 11, 46–56.
- Büyükdağ, N., Soysal, A. N., & Kítapci, O. (2020). The effect of specific discount pattern in terms of price promotions on perceived price attractiveness and purchase intention: An experimental research. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 55, 102112. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jretconser.2020.102112
- Calvo-Porral, C., & Lévy-Mangin, J.-P. (2017). Store brands' purchase intention: Examining the role of perceived quality. *European Research on Management and Business Economics*, 23(2), 90–95. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.iedeen.2016.10.001
- Chiu, W., & Cho, H. (2019). E-commerce brand: The effect of perceived brand leadership on consumers' satisfaction and repurchase intention on e-commerce websites. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 33(6), 1339–1362. https://doi.org/10.1108/APJML-10-2018-0403
- Chou, S., & Chen, C.-W. (2018). The influences of relational benefits on repurchase intention in service contexts: the roles of gratitude, trust and commitment. *Journal of Business & Industrial Marketing*.
- Citilink. (2022). Citilink. https://www.citilink.co.id/
- Cook, G. N., & Billig, B. (2017). Airline Operations and Management: A Management Textbook. Taylor & Francis. https://books.google.co.id/books?id=aiglDwAAQBAJ
- Dileep, M. R., & Kurien, A. (2021). Air Transport and Tourism: Interrelationship, Operations and Strategies. Routledge.
- Dirsehan, T., & Kurtulus, S. (2018). Measuring brand image using a cognitive approach: Representing brands as a network in the Turkish airline industry. *Journal of Air Transport Management*, 67, 85–93. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jairtraman.2017.11.010
- DJPU. (2018). Pertumbuhan Sektor Transportasi Udara Mencerminkan Pertumbuhan Ekonomi Nasional. http://hubud.dephub.go.id/hubud/website/berita.php?id=ZTFmYzljMDgyZGY2Y2ZmZjhjYmNmZmYyYjVhNzlyZ WY=
- Fall Diallo, M., Chandon, J., Cliquet, G., & Philippe, J. (2013). Factors influencing consumer behaviour towards store brands: evidence from the French market. International Journal of Retail & Distribution Management, 41(6), 422–441. https://doi.org/10.1108/09590551311330816
- Ferdinand, A. (2014). Metode Penelitian Manajemen edisi kelima. Badan Penerbit Universitas Diponegoro, Semarang.
- George, R. (2021). Marketing Tourism and Hospitality. the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-64111-5
- Hair, Jr. J. E., Hult, G. T. M., Ringle, C. M., & Sarstedt, M. (2021). A Primer on Partial Least Squares Structural Equation Modeling (PLS-SEM). SAGE Publications. https://books.google.co.id/books?id=6z83EAAAQBAJ
- Han, H., Yu, J., Chua, B. L., Lee, S., & Kim, W. (2019). Impact of core-product and service-encounter quality, attitude, image, trust and love on repurchase: Full-service vs low-cost carriers in South Korea. International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management, 31(4), 1588–1608. https://doi.org/10.1108/IJCHM-05-2018-0376
- Hawa Bunga, Y., & Mawardi, M. K. (2017). Strategi Pemasaran Penerbangan Berkonsep Low Cost Carrier (Lcc) dan Daya Saing Perusahaan (Studi pada Maskapai Penerbangan PT. Garuda Indonesia Citilink). Jurnal Administrasi Bisnis S1 Universitas Brawijaya, 51(2), 168–178.
- Herng, M., Yashodha, Y., & Elixir, /. (2012). AirAsia Berhad: Strategic analysis of a leading low-cost carrier in the Asian region. In *Mgmt. Arts* (Vol. 51). www.elixirpublishers.com

- Huang, L.-C., Gao, M., & Hsu, P.-F. (2019). A Study on the Effect of Brand Image on Perceived Value and Repurchase Intention in Ecotourism Industry. In *Ekoloji* (Vol. 28, Issue 107).
- Ibzan, E., Balarabe, F., & Jakada, B. (2016). Consumer satisfaction and repurchase intentions. *Developing Country Studies*, 6(2), 96–100.
- Indonesia, P. R. (2009). Undang Undang Republik Indonesia No I Tahun 2009. https://jdih.dephub.go.id/assets/uudocs/uu/2009/UU%20No.1%20Tahun%202009.pdf
- Janiszewski, C., & Cunha, M. J. (2004). The Influence of Price Discount Framing on the Evaluation of a Product Bundle. Journal of Consumer Research, 30(4), 534–546. https://doi.org/10.1086/380287
- Juwairiyah, S. (2019). Pengaruh Brand Image, Brand Trust dan Perceived Price terhadap Repurchase Intention pada tiket maskapai penerbangan Lion Air (Studi pada mahasiswa/i SI Universitas Brawijaya). https://jimfeb.ub.ac.id/index.php/jimfeb/article/view/5978
- Kearns, S. (2021). Fundamentals of International Aviation. Routledge.
- Keller, K. (2013). Strategic Brand Management, 4th Edition. Pearson Education Limited.
- Kemenperin. (2017). Indonesia Masuk Kategori Negara Industri. https://kemenperin.go.id/artikel/18473/Indonesia-Masuk-Kategori-Negara-Industri
- Kevin Lucas, & Tjokrosaputro Miharni. (2021). Pengaruh Perceived Price dan Country of Origin terhadap Repurchase Intention merek minuman Xi Fu Tang di Jakarta: Word of Mouth sebagai variabel Mediasi. *Jurnal Manajerial Dan Kewirausahaan*, 3, 52–60.
- Kim, C., Galliers, R. D., Shin, N., Ryoo, J. H., & Kim, J. (2012). Factors influencing Internet shopping value and customer repurchase intention. *Electronic Commerce Research and Applications*, 11(4), 374–387. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.elerap.2012.04.002
- Kotler, P., & Armstrong, G. (2021). Principles of Marketing Global Edition. Pearson Education.
- Kotler, P., Bowen, J. T., Makens, J., & Baloglu, S. (2021). *Marketing for Hospitality and Tourism* (Global Edition). Pearson Education. https://books.google.co.id/books?id=MQQyEAAAQBAJ
- Lian, J. W., & Yen, D. C. (2014). Online shopping drivers and barriers for older adults: Age and gender differences. Computers in Human Behavior, 37, 133–143. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2014.04.028
- Liu, C. H. S., & Lee, T. (2016). Service quality and price perception of service: Influence on word-of-mouth and revisit intention. *Journal of Air Transport Management*, 52, 42–54. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jairtraman.2015.12.007
- Maharani, C., & Andrianto, T. (2014). Pengaruh Brand Positioning Wonderful Indonesia Terhadap Keputusan Wisatawan Mancanegara Untuk Berkunjung Ke Indonesia (Survei Terhadap Wisatawan Mancanegara Asal Singapore, Malaysia dan Australia). THE Journal: Tourism and Hospitality Essentials Journal, 4(1), 741–758.
- Megantara, I. M. T., & Suryani, A. (2016). Penentu niat pembelian kembali tiket pesawat secara online pada situs traveloka. com. *E-Jurnal Manajemen Unud*, 5(9), 5783–5810.
- Moslehpour, M., Wong, W. K., van Pham, K., & Aulia, C. K. (2017). Repurchase intention of Korean beauty products among Taiwanese consumers. Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics, 29(3), 569–588. https://doi.org/10.1108/APJML-06-2016-0106
- Nisar, T. M., & Whitehead, C. (2016). Brand interactions and social media: Enhancing user loyalty through social networking sites. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 62, 743–753.
- Obasi, R., & Amadi, L. (2022). Brand Price Positioning Strategy and Sales Turnover of Food and Beverage Manufacturing Companies In Rivers State Nigeria. In *Int. J. Social Science Humanities Research* (Vol. 05, Issue 01).
- Pan, J. Y., & Truong, D. (2018). Passengers' intentions to use low-cost carriers: An extended theory of planned behavior model. Journal of Air Transport Management, 69, 38–48. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jairtraman.2018.01.006

- Putri, L. H. (2016). Faktor-Faktor yang mempengaruhi minat pembelian ulang konsumen terhadap produk naget delicy. Jurnal Manajemen Dan Start-up Bisnis, 1(2), 162–170.
- Rakatama, M., & Winarto, A. (2021). Pengaruh Brand Image dan Brand Love Terhadap Repurchase Intention (Studi Kasus pada Konsumen Produk Gucci di Surabaya). https://journal.inspirasi.or.id/index.php/nomicpedia
- Ringle, C. M., Wende, S., & Becker, J.-M. (2022). SmartPLS4. Oststeinbek: SmartPLS GmbH. https://www.smartpls.com/
- Santos, J. D., & Silva, O. L. (2019). Digital marketing strategies for tourism, hospitality, and airline industries. IGI Global.
- Savila, I. D., Wathoni, R. N., & Santoso, A. S. (2019). The role of multichannel integration, trust and offline-to-online customer loyalty towards repurchase intention: An empirical study in online-to-offline (O2O) e-commerce. Procedia Computer Science, 161, 859–866.
- Sekaran, U., & Bougie, R. (2016). Research Methods for Business. www.wileypluslearningspace.com
- Setiadi, D. N. J. (2019). Perilaku Konsumen Perspektif Kontemporer pada Motif, Tujuan, dan Keinginan Konsumen Edisi Ketiga. Prenada Media.
- Situmorang, T. P., Indriani, F., Simatumpang, R. A., & Soesanto, H. (2021). Brand positioning and repurchase intention: The effect of attitude toward green brand. *The Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business*, 8(4), 491–499.
- Stefano, T. (2019). Pengaruh Perceived Service Quality, Perceived Product Quality, dan Perceived Price terhadap Repurchase Intention pada Cafe Kampung Papringan Lumajang (Vol. 7, Issue 2).
- Suhaily, L., & Soelasih, Y. (2017). What Effects Repurchase Intention of Online Shopping. International Business Research, 10(12), 113. https://doi.org/10.5539/ibr.v10n12p113
- Suryana, P., & Dasuki, E. S. (2013). Analisis Faktor yang Mempengaruhi Keputusan Pembelian dan Implikasinya pada Minat Beli Ulang. TRIKONOMIKA, 12(2), 190–200. https://doi.org/10.23969/trikonomika.v12i2.479
- Tuten, T. L. (2019). Principles of Marketing for a Digital Age. SAGE.
- Wibisono, T. (2018). Pengaruh Product Characteristics, Perceived Price terhadap Repurchase Intention melalui Perceived Quality pada Rumah Makan Olala Jalan Glagahsari Yogyakarta. In Jurnal Ekobis Dewantara (Vol. 1, Issue 6).
- Yamane, T. (1973). Statistics. An introductory analysis. Third edition. Harper & Row. https://books.google.co.id/books?id=sl75MgEACAAJ
- Yasa, I. K. (2018). The Role of Brand Image mediating the effect of Product Quality on Repurchase Intention. Russian Journal of Agricultural and Socio-Economic Sciences, 83(11), 172–180. https://doi.org/10.18551/rjoas.2018-11.20
- Yasri, Y., Susanto, P., Hoque, M. E., & Gusti, M. A. (2020). Price perception and price appearance on repurchase intention of Gen Y: do brand experience and brand preference mediate? *Heliyon*, 6(11). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2020.e05532